Decision of the FIBAA Accreditation Committee for Institutional Procedures

13th Meeting on April 13th, 2015

Project Number: 14/005
Higher Education Institution: ESB Business School of Reutlingen University
Institutional Procedure: Institutional Strategic Management Accreditation

The FIBAA Accreditation Committee for Institutional Procedures has taken the following decision:

According to § 7 (2) in conjunction with § 10 (1) of the “Special Conditions for awarding the FIBAA Quality Seal for the Institutional Accreditation” the HEI is accredited.

Period of Accreditation: April 13th, 2015 until April 12th, 2021

The FIBAA Quality Seal is awarded.
Institutional Accreditation

ESB Business School of Reutlingen University

Assessment report
Accreditation process

The contract on Institutional Accreditation was agreed upon by ESB Business School and the FIBAA on February 20th, 2014. The self-evaluation report was submitted by ESB on December 22nd, 2014. The report included a SWOT-Analysis for each area.

In the meantime FIBAA appointed a review panel. The panel members are:

Prof. Dr. Dieter Hessel  
University of Applied Sciences Salzburg

Dr. André Rieck  
University of Applied Sciences Kiel

Prof. Dr. Peter Thuy  
Career Partner GmbH, Munich  
CAO und Managing Director

Dr. jur. Gisela Nagel  
Groth & Pakutz – Rechtsanwälte, Cologne  
Lawyer

Grischa Fraumann  
Danube University Krems, Austria; University of Tampere, Finland, Beijing Normal University, China; Osnabrück University of Applied Sciences  
Student of "Master in Research and Innovation in Higher Education – MARIHE" (M.Sc. (Admin.))

FIBAA project manager:  
Ass.jur. Lars Weber

The panel’s appraisal took into account the self-evaluation report, supplemented with further documents requested by the panel, and the results of the on-site visit. The on-site visit took place on ESB’s premises in Reutlingen on February 2nd till 4th, 2015. At the end of the visit, the panel gave a short feedback on its first impression to the representatives of ESB.

On March 16th, 2015 the assessment report, which contains recommendations for further development, was forwarded to ESB with the request to comment on its findings. The FIBAA panel received the comments of ESB on March 25th, 2015 and took it into account when finalising the assessment report.
Summary:

Based on the assessment report the FIBAA Accreditation Committee for Institutional Procedures decided upon accreditation in its meeting on April 13th, 2015. FIBAA awards its Quality Seal for Institutional Accreditation

The ESB Business School of Reutlingen University is accredited. The accreditation is valid (see § 10 Special conditions for awarding the FIBAA quality seal for Institutional Accreditation) for six years.

For the overall assessment, please refer to the quality profile at the end of this report.

The measures the HEI will take in order to implement the recommendations of the panel members are to be considered in the context of re-accreditation.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Current state of play and appraisal</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0. Basic Data and information</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Management</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appraisal</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Networks</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appraisal</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Teaching and Learning (Contents/Didactics), Research</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.1 Teaching and Learning Appraisal</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV University Dynamics Appraisal</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV University Dynamics Appraisal</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.2 Research</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appraisal</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Evaluation of the SWOT-Analyses</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Quality profile Institutional Accreditation of ESB Business School</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## A. Current state of play and appraisal

### 0. Basic Data and information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the University/ School</th>
<th>ESB Business School (School of Reutlingen University) Hochschule Reutlingen</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Legal status of the institution</td>
<td>State University/ Staatliche Hochschule Hochschule für angewandte Wissenschaften - University of Applied Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Founding year</td>
<td>1855 – Founding of Reutlingen University as a technical college of Weaving and Textile for the local textile industry 1971 – Reutlingen University was established as University of Applied Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of faculty/ academic staff of ESB Business School</td>
<td>62 tenured professorships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of professional staff</td>
<td>50 (headcount): 40 academic staff, 10 administrative staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of adjunct faculty</td>
<td>150 adjunct faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of degree programmes</td>
<td>4 Bachelor Programmes (B.Sc. International Management Double Degree includes 10 partner programmes) 7 Master’s Programmes (20 Bachelor’s and Master’s programmes) +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of students, degree-seeking</td>
<td>2,777 (WS 2014/15) in total 50,3% female, 49,6% male German 71,4%, non-German nationality 28,5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International student population</td>
<td>30 %, 81 nationalities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incomings per semester</td>
<td>499 incoming exchange students (WS 2014/15)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outgoings per semester</td>
<td>464 (16,7%) outgoing students abroad (WS 2014/15)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Academic Partnerships</td>
<td>111 institutions in 35 countries (Summer 2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industry partnerships</td>
<td>45 Partners (Verein zur Förderung der internationalen Managementausbildung (Boston Consulting Group, IBM, Procter &amp; Gamble, Ernst &amp; Young, SAP, Shell, L’Oréal, etc.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The institution Reutlingen University was founded in 1855. In 1908 it received state recognition as the “State Technical College for the Textile Industry”. In 1971, the textile engineering college became a University of Applied Sciences. In the same year, the business department was founded which played a pivotal role in establishing international business programmes including an MBA and international double degree programmes. Since 2006 the institution has the official title Reutlingen University of Applied Sciences (“Hochschule für Angewandte Wissenschafeten”). The University is state funded by public means and under national statutes and the law of the state Baden-Württemberg.

The university comprises five schools: ESB Business School, Applied Chemistry, Informatics, Engineering and Textiles & Design. There are currently about 5,500 full-time students enrolled at the university; over a third come from 91 different countries other than Germany.

In 2010 the university was awarded the title of Germany’s Most International University by the Association for the Promotion of German Science and Humanities (Stifterverband für die Deutsche Wissenschaft) and the German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD – Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst).

Reutlingen University is organised into the five schools and complemented by central services, namely the International Office and Language Centre, the Information Centre and Library, IT- and Media-Centre. The Reutlingen Research Institute (RRI) is pooling the management of research projects under one roof, focusing on applied research, in general in cooperation with regional, internationally operating companies.

The University Advisory Board (Hochschulrat) provides guidance and supervision regarding strategy development, management and competitiveness; an elected University Board (the Senate) stands for democratic decision processes. ESB Business School is part of Reutlingen University and its governance structure is on one hand driven by the University’s mission and regulations and on the other hand by the principles of selfgovernance, focusing on continuous development and improvement.

In terms of funding, staffing, and administration of student affairs, ESB is a central part of Reutlingen University and participates in the democratic processes of self-administration. ESB has a high degree of autonomy in the planning and implementation of study programmes and the contents of its teaching. Compliance with regulations and quality standards are monitored by the university and operationalised by the ESB Quality Management team.

ESB Business School is governed by the ESB Management Board (ESB-Vorstand) comprising of the Dean, the Vice Dean and the Dean of Studies. The Dean reports directly to the President of the University and the External Advisory Committee. The Management Board is supported by departmental managers, being responsible for International Relations, Marketing, Research and IT/infrastructure. The Management Board comprises all executive functions of the Business School. It is responsible for HR development and for maintaining highly qualified faculty. It determines, after consultation with the Business School Council, the teaching, managing and service responsibilities of all teaching faculty members.

The members of the Advisory Board of ESB Business School (Beirat ESB) support the school in developing vision and strategy. They provide consultancy concerning professional qualification requirements, reputation, academic and research perspectives.

The conference of programme directors (Studiendekanekonferenz) meets at least once per semester to discuss the portfolio profile of ESB Business School and to coordinate curricula, teaching and learning issues. Their focus also includes the evaluation of student’s progression, including recruiting and admissions as well as exam procedures and results. Teaching evaluation and accreditation requirements are included as frameworks of reference for the continuous development of teaching and learning.
The Business School Council (Fakultätsrat) advises the faculty in all questions of school-wide relevance. The approval of the Faculty Council is required for
- structure and development plans;
- creation, changes or dissolution of institutions of the school and study programmes;
- study and examination regulations, appointment nominations (Berufungsvorschläge).

Decisions of the Business School Council concerning the modification of study programmes require the ratification of the respective programme development committee. The Business School Council consists of elected professors, students and members of staff.

The Business School Council confirms the deployment of decentralised programme development committees (Studienkommission) for each study programme offered at ESB Business School. The legitimated members of the commission are programme directors, professors teaching in the respective programme, students and study coordinators. Their task is to review study programmes and to develop recommendations for teaching content and structure of study programmes.

The Curriculum Committee is a new and over-arching entity which advises the Management Board, the Business School Council and the Programme Director's Conference on the development of new or modification of existing study programmes. It was established in autumn 2014 and will take office starting with the calendar year 2015, in order to implement comprehensive quality assurance of learning system.

The Faculty Qualifications Committee (FQC) was established in autumn 2014 with the aim to evaluate and to provide input for a strategic mapping and development of the faculty qualifications in total. The committee develops qualification criteria for faculty members and formulates target aims concerning scholarship, teaching, professional experience, management functions and service.

The Knowledge Foundation at Reutlingen University (KFRU) is a non-commercial provider of part-time corporate programmes in compliance with the mission requirements of Reutlingen University. Due to a strong demand for corporate, part-time study programmes for professionals, ESB Business School has developed tailor-made programmes in cooperation with industry or business partners. Established in 2008, the KFRU specialises in corporate programmes offered in cooperation with companies such as IBM, HP or Aldi Süd. It is supervised by Reutlingen University and the foundation council. Sustainable financing is secured and a regulation framework is in place to ensure academic quality of the degree programmes.

Governed by the principle of subsidiarity and at the same time close coordination and strategic co-operation among University, faculty and programme directors, decision making at ESB Business School is characterised by the commitment to shared aims. The decision making procedures and co-operative structures of the Business School, including school management functions and programme management can be visualised as following:
The core focus of ESB Business School lies in the field of academic teaching and learning. The aim is to qualify graduates not only for an international career and to ensure employability in the business world, but also to educate rounded personalities, committed to active citizenship, intercultural and social responsibility.

Research has, despite structural limitations governing Universities of Applied sciences, gained considerable significance for the University and ESB Business School. By setting up cooperative activities, by raising research funds and creating innovative “Centres for Teaching and Research” they have strengthened and extended their activities in the academic as well as in the economic field.

State funding and, to a lesser degree, school-specific funds ensure sustainable financial resources to fulfil ESB Business School’s educational mission. State-funding is allocated by the Ministry for Science, Research and the Arts of the State of Baden-Württemberg, based on the number of students enrolled in individual study programs. Salaries of faculty and staff with permanent contracts are directly paid for by the state. The same applies to infrastructure and buildings including maintenance thereof, providing the university and ESB Business School with secure financial resources. In addition to basic state funding as described above, the school receives state subsidies to cover operational expenses and costs (i.e. equipment, library, office supply, etc.). A special state government funding scheme (Ausbauprogramm 2020) provides resources for the extension of capacity of selected programmes. The completion of a first and a consecutive degree is tuition free; accordingly, income from tuition fees within ESB’s budget originate from bachelor or master programmes which are being completed by students or participants as a consecutive degree or in continuing education at their own expense (MBA-Programmes and international Management M.Sc.).
I. Management

I.1 What is the orientation pursued by the university in its activities (mission, vision, objectives)?

ESB Business School’s core educational mission is to provide high quality management education to a multi-national student community.

ESB Vision states that ESB Business School is committed to upholding its tradition in providing outstanding international, practice-oriented education and professional training as well as applied research. Guided by the values of respect, trust, responsibility and commitment, ESB Business School as part of state-funded Reutlingen University, strives to be distinctive by becoming the most international Business School in Germany and in its offer of highly attractive programmes to students who aspire to fulfil challenging roles in companies and organisations in an international context.

The Business School’s mission statement claims: "Within an educational environment that is truly international, we develop leaders who shape global business practice and society responsibly”. In order to live up to that mission ESB aims to:

- produce socially responsible graduates who are highly employable worldwide;
- achieve academic excellence in accordance with international quality and educational standards;
- forge strong international and sustainable partnerships (alumni, academic & research);
- leverage the international expertise of faculty to conduct innovative, relevant teaching and applied research that shapes business practice;
- develop and maintain a values-driven vision and service approach based on mutual trust and respect, individual commitment and shared responsibility towards our local and global stakeholders

ESB Business School’s overall strategy development including its mission statement follows a clearly defined process and is subject to regular review which is being undertaken in the context of the development of the school’s strategic management plan (SEP). The latest revision of the mission statement in 2014 involved five task forces and eleven working groups discussing and specifying topics related to all key management areas including strategy, organisation and governance, degree programmes, research, vision, and values. All group sessions, meeting results, and decisions have been documented and minutes thereof are archived in the Dean’s office. All strategic goals included in the school’s SEP are being discussed and reviewed at an annual board meeting, the results of which are mapped in a “traffic light”-system. This controlling tool allows for a comprehensive visualisation of targets and progress tracking at degree programme as well as school level. The “traffic light”-system also includes a project timeline which comprises clearly defined work packages which need to be completed within the given 5-year period. Since not all targets may be addressed simultaneously, ordering them on an overall timeline is vital and has proven useful. According to ESB, this approach is rather unusual and innovative in the context of German public higher education. Consistent compliance with established time frames and assessment of achievement of objectives is fundamental for ESB Business School.

The following figure describes the development of strategic goals including the mission at University and at the Business School level:
I.2 How does the management of the university promote innovation in its different performance fields (administration, research, and teaching)?

Structured innovation and change management processes are advanced by working groups. Accordingly, to shape future development, the faculty board defined in 2013/14 five strategic focus areas and appointed relevant team members for each of the action fields:

- Focus Area I – Global Employability of Graduates;
- Focus Area II – Academic Excellence and Quality;
- Focus Area III – Strong International Network;
- Focus Area IV – Teaching and Research Impact;
- Focus Area V – Responsible Organisation.

The working groups have set up defined targets, derived from the vision and mission statement of ESB Business School, and action items to push innovation and to achieve results. The strategic management and coordination of innovation focuses on its three core performance areas: teaching, process development, research.

Teaching and programme development:
Study programmes, programme structures and teaching and learning methods are developed by including relevant stakeholders. ESB Business School uses its options (within a regulated framework for study programmes) to set up pilot models for teaching and learning. The Business School revised the existing programme portfolio by introducing different formats (full-time/part-time), languages, varying length of programmes, target groups (open or focus groups), teaching methods (project-, e-learning components, international studies), or by developing fully new programmes, mainly based on request of companies or interest groups. Relevant measures are:

- advancement of an innovative mind-set by initialising strategic workshops, stakeholder discussions etc.;
future-oriented programme development based on a comprehensive analysis of demand, competitors and market opportunities;
awards ("Innovative Teaching Award") and promotion of innovative teaching such as project learning, IT-supported learning, online-teaching;
definition of learning outcomes and implementation of assurance of learning processes (see chapter III.1);
creation of innovative life-long study formats in co-operation with the Knowledge Foundation.

Process development, administration and services:
Efficient processes are in place to avoid that administrative processes lag behind the schedule: on the one hand by a strong service-orientation of ESB Business School and on the other hand by involving all faculty members in the planning and steering processes. All faculty members are encouraged to develop their respective areas of responsibility: this applies for the organisation of study programmes as well as for Business School-wide functions managed by academic and administrative staff. The implemented elements here are:

• process management covering all phases of the students life-cycle and dynamic structures by continuous process development and improvement measures;
• close coordination with international partners to find matching solutions;
• service-orientation concerning increasingly individualised career paths and requirements of disadvantaged students;
• professional development measures by knowledge exchange with partners, trainings, expert group meetings available for all faculty members;
• participation of administrative staff in the planning process.

Research development:
ESB Business School focuses on applied research. The development of its research policy includes various measures to promote activities of faculty members and students in fields such as:

• introduction of an incentive system for research (FASY-Forschungsanreizsystem) including budget, award and mentoring;
• project support e.g. for bidding procedures and research proposals and for the administration of projects by staff and Reutlingen Research Institute;
• promotion of research and knowledge transfer activities (sabbaticals, mobility grants, bonuses for publications etc.);
• development and maintenance of research partnerships;
• encouragement, support and coaching of student’s innovative business projects, start-ups, entrepreneurs; support for proactive initiatives e.g. participation in competitions, grant proposals.

Innovative initiatives, creativity and engagement are, in general, valued activities and ESB Business School encourages change and individual growth. ESB Business School claims to “step ahead” and “not to rest on its laurels”. Continuous innovation has proven to be a success factor for ESB Business School and is part of the strategic management process of ESB Business School. It is not only the basis for the continuous improvement of study programmes but also the basic premise for the Business School’s competitive strength.

I.3 How are the university’s supervisory bodies (University Council, Senate) integrated into decision-making processes?

ESB Business School’s strategic management process involves several committees and decision making considers their various perspectives and interests.

• The currently 29 members of the Advisory Board of ESB Business School (Beirat) are experienced and highly respected professional and academic representatives supporting the school in developing vision and strategy. They provide consultancy
concerning ESB’s positioning, professional qualification requirements, reputation, academic and research perspectives. In general, the advisory board meets twice a year and is included in designing the strategic development plan, new study programmes and structural changes. Consulting for specific thematic subjects is generally provided by expert sub-groups.

- The Business School Council (Fakultätsrat), including elected members of all status groups of ESB Business School, has the legally defined function of a democratic “parliament” and makes sure that decisions are supported and approved by the overall, here represented faculty. Approval and the ratification of substantial decisions are needed.
- The Advisory Board of Hochschule Reutlingen (Hochschulrat) contributes to the management of ESB Business School. The board is composed of eleven board members, both external professionals and members of Reutlingen University. They are, according to the law, involved in the following decisions:
  - election of members of the management board of the university (Präsidium) in cooperation with the senate;
  - decisions about development plans, strategic management, development of infrastructure;
  - budget planning and allocation of resources;
  - cooperation agreements;
  - foundation of commercial enterprises.
The advisory board has a supervisory function and the Management board of the university reports four times a year to the board.
- The Senate is the elected University parliament with executive functions. It decides or has to agree upon a range of relevant strategic matters. It decides on research, development plans, teaching and education and further education. ESB Business School also includes the advice of further committees focused on specific areas (Advisory board of the Knowledge Foundation; Advisory boards for study programmes; Verein für die Internationale Managementausbildung – V.I.M.A. members).

I.4 What importance is placed on entrepreneurial thought and activity in the management of the university, and how are these promoted?

Characteristic entrepreneurial traits of ESB Business School can be identified in its competitiveness and its strive for innovation. Within the organisational structures of a state-governed public institution the entrepreneurial mind-set is incorporated through a set of management instruments such as customer-orientation, sustainable allocation and cost effectiveness of expenses, quality management, progress monitoring, responsibility and accountability.

ESB Business School was a relevant driver for the establishment of the Knowledge Foundation. It is (while being a non-profit organisation) governed by entrepreneurial principles and has proven to be successful. Its programmes and offerings are paying for itself and are operating on a sustainable financial basis.

ESB Business Schools entrepreneurial activities rely, by now, to a big extent on individual efforts. It will be a future task for ESB Business School and especially Reutlingen University to further develop and institutionalise sustaining framework conditions for entrepreneurship, to include the expertise of Reutlingen Research Institute and to improve visibility for external stakeholders. Nevertheless, the entrepreneurial mind-set of ESB Business School produces long-term spill-over effects e.g. reflected in alumni careers.

The support of entrepreneurial activities at ESB Business School is based on a multi-dimensional concept connecting actors within and outside the university to bundle expertise, institutional anchoring and sustainable funding strategies. Continuous communication and
cooperation among these parties are maintained in order to create an encouraging framework for start-up initiatives.

ESB Business School supports personal engagement and initiative in the context of its mission and its organisational structures. A strong commitment of all faculty members and cooperation to put ideas into practice characterises the atmosphere of ESB Business School. ESB’s students are “creative and innovative, think like entrepreneurs, are eager to learn, and have a strong sense of social responsibility”. Students are encouraged to engage in entrepreneurship activities by

- faculty-wide seminars and workshops on entrepreneurship and setting up of business plans;
- supporting the participation in various business plan and start-up competitions e.g. NewBizCup;
- the student’s department “ESB Entrepreneurs”, since 2010, providing consulting and knowledge exchange at “start-up weekend”;
- expert discussions with ESB entrepreneurs and business founders.

Start-up and Spin-off initiatives of students and graduates are supported and subsidised by providing office facilities on the campus (“First-step”) free of charge and by networking with relevant stakeholders.

ESB Business School maintains relationships to incubator or accelerator institutions and providers of venture capital and it’s alumni are for example active in the board of German Start Up’s (“Bundesverband Deutsche Start Ups e.V.”) or a new venture program at “Strascheg Center for Entrepreneurship gGmbH”. In regular forum discussions and workshops ESB-Alumni are reporting about their entrepreneurial or start-up activities. They provide advice for interested students or mentorship for new initiatives. The promotion of entrepreneurial activities within the faculty is anchored in the mind-set of ESB Business School and is evidenced by

- specialised professorships as part of the ESB faculty, e.g. professor for entrepreneurship (in the area of business) and professor for innovation management (in the area of operations management);
- ESB Professor in the function of entrepreneurship appointee of the University (Gründungsbeauftragter);
- business experience and sustained business relationships of faculty (with e.g. managing, supervisory or consulting functions);
- support of entrepreneurial activities of professors (organised under the roof of Knowledge Foundation@Reutlingen University);
- knowledge transfer projects (e.g. business consulting for technology projects).

I.5 What proportion of the services offered by the university is less than 3-5 years old?

Following the successful accreditation of all degree programmes in 2009 the study programme portfolio offered by ESB Business School was revised: From 2009-2014, 50 % of the core ESB programmes were fully revised or newly created (5 out of now 10 programmes). Six new part-time programmes were developed by ESB which are organised in cooperation with the Knowledge Foundation@Reutlingen University to serve corporate needs. The Bachelor programmes are continuously developed while keeping their original goals in mind. Nevertheless, substantial changes were introduced:

- The double degree programme International Management was extended and now includes the University of International Business and Economics UIBE in Beijing as a new Double Degree Partner since 2014;
- The International Business (B.Sc.) Programme was revised in 2011 and is now offered entirely in English with majors in Marketing and Strategy, Finance and Accounting and Human Resource Management and Organisation.
The Production and the Logistics Management Bachelor programmes were revised and adjusted according to updated learning outcomes. A distinctive international profile (from 2014 on) characterises the “International Operations and Logistics Management” Bachelor, including eight semesters fully taught in English and an international semester abroad.

The Master-Portfolio is on the way to be aligned with the revised mission and quality standards of ESB. One out of seven Master programmes started with a fully revised concept in 2013. This follow-up Master programme “Operations Management” (M.Sc.) – replacing two former programmes – is characterised by an innovative project learning approach. Since 2009 a new Double Degree Master Programme was set up in cooperation with Université de Strasbourg (European Management Studies, M.A.). New corporate programmes in cooperation with the Knowledge Foundation are:

- Business and Process Management (M.Sc.) 2010;
- Strategic Sales Management (M.A.) 2011;
- International Retail Management (M.A.) 2012;
- Management for Pharmacists (MBA) 2014;
- International Business (M.Sc.) German-Indian programme (in English) in implementation phase.

Over the last five years 44 new international university partnerships have been ratified and the student exchange and double degree options for programmes were extended. Support and grants for faculty mobility have been guaranteed. Human resource development has been advanced, including training programmes in the area of international and intercultural competence.

Services for students have been improved (e.g. services for international students such as language trainings, interdisciplinary and extracurricular course offerings bundled for example under the headline “studieren plus”, which a course programme for Reutlingen University students).

I.6 What strategic steps have been taken to further advance the university?

Strategic measures are in general initiated and implemented by the management board of ESB Business School in accordance with internal and external stakeholders. Following the strategic development plan (2012-2016), ESB Business School defines concrete goals for the promotion of its international orientation and its attractiveness.

In 2014 ESB Business School developed, based on a Balanced Scorecard Model, a sustainable alignment plan, embedding individual strategic initiatives into the School’s overall strategic management plan. The alignment plan of ESB Business School consolidates the mission driven strategic management processes and the implementation of international quality standards of AACSB into one all-embracing and school-wide change management process.

Five strategic focus areas have been identified (see I.2) and corresponding task forces, consisting of a designated task force leader and an associated work group of volunteer faculty and staff, have been established. Outcome of these task force activities are the definition of concrete action items, time-lines and resources needed for the implementation of measures included in the strategic alignment plan. The management of ESB Business School initiated strategic development activities in the following areas:

- Quality driven development of Teaching and Learning by monitoring of learning outcomes (assurance of learning) appropriate and innovative teaching and learning methods (development of online teaching) development of personal skill-set revision of Master programmes;
• International excellence by quality driven expansion of partnerships further development of international & curriculum content (e.g. English language programmes, double degrees e.g. with China) improvement of international visibility and recruitment implementation of international quality standards;
• Organisational development, human resource development, staff exchange strategic programme development (part-time programmes) in Cooperation with Knowledge Foundation;
• Expansion of research activities by cooperating in networks and with companies to advance applied research increasing and inducing publication activities raising of third party funds improvement of research and teaching and learning infrastructure (labs and new building).

I.7 How does strategy/innovation contribute to the development of resources and staff so as to render the implementation of that strategy feasible?

The allocation of financial and staff resources to promote strategic development is managed within the framework of State ministry provision and regulations, ensuring a stable funding of faculty (professorships and academic staff) and infrastructure. Based on these resources and on third party project funds ESB Business School allocates its disposable resources as far as possible to its priorities.

Performance-related allocation of means or paying of faculty staff is not part of the public budget and wage system, but a bonus system for publications and research activities is in place. Academic staff and administration are, by now, informally rewarded and supported in their personal and professional development e.g. by granting sabbaticals, training and qualification grants, support of international staff exchange.

Development projects are funded by additional funds of the ministry (e.g. “Bachelor-/Master-Ausbauprogramm”, quality assurance funds) or third party means (e.g. project funds, DAAD funding etc.). The regular budget of ESB Business School is also complemented by support from companies (V.I.M.A.) and by license fees provided by the Knowledge Foundation. The extension of fundraising activities is planned, especially in the area of third party funding and by gaining research grants.

Appraisal:

The panel formed the view that the ESB Business School has assessed its positioning in the educational field realistically and formulated a very clear and convincing mission statement. The strategic concept with the five focus areas is clearly described and comprehensible and the panel is persuaded of its viability. The strategic management plan (SEP) is very detailed and in the view of the panel appropriate to check the stage of development of the individual measures to achieve defined goals. The measures taken by the Business School’s management in the fields of teaching/learning, internationalisation, human resource development and research activities are coherent, goal-oriented and efficient. Via two advisory boards and the Business School Council an external view is warranted as well.

Furthermore, in the implemented decision-making-structures the Business School masters the balancing act between centralisation and participation very well. In the interviews during the on-site visit the panel observed a consistent orientation of the School’s structures towards the interests of the students and staff. Hence, ESB has developed a coherent, effective, credible, and organisationally anchored strategy for continuous innovation and for the generation of benefits for its target groups, so that all employees in all areas are not only aware of it, but also pro-actively support its implementation.
Entrepreneurial thought and action are anchored clearly in the Business School’s self-image and it creates a climate which fosters innovation in the different areas of the Business School’s work. Prove for this can be found in the activities of the Knowledge Foundation and the activities and cooperation of the school regarding the promotion of business ideas and entrepreneurship by the students. The same attitude of ESB is shown in the development of the study programme portfolio as well as in establishing new and mostly international cooperative and strategic partnerships within the last years.

The panel also appreciates that both decisions and decision-making-processes are documented clearly and transparent for all interested parties. Visualisations like organisation charts are beneficial as well as the high degree of transparency.

Regarding the finances the panel considers the centralised distribution as very useful. The development concept for the School is very flexible and the panel appreciates very much that individual development is not limited to the specific work field of an employee. The flexibility of the system is shown in the fact that an employee can use an individual budget over three years which means that saving budget for the future or using it in advance is possible. Furthermore, the School’s faculty incentive schemes like the bonus system for publication and research or the possibility of exchange programmes and sabbaticals seem to be very useful to promote the target achievement.

Altogether, the panel assesses the resources which are made available as appropriate. But the amount of activities (meetings, task forces, boards, etc.) of the Business School’s staff and especially the faculty is extremely high and could cause, in the view of the panel, future problems. The panel points out that faculty and staff capacities might be overstretched. Acknowledging the outstanding commitment of faculty and staff it is, nevertheless, recommended to pay special attention on the employee’s capacities (regarding the human resources see also chapter B. SWOT-Analyses.)

Criteria Management
I.1 What is the orientation pursued by the university in its activities (mission, vision, objectives)?
I.2 How does the management of the university promote innovation in its different performance fields (administration, research, and teaching)?
I.3 How are the university’s supervisory bodies (University Council, Senate) integrated into decision-making processes?
I.4 What importance is placed on entrepreneurial thought and activity in the management of the university, and how are these promoted?
I.5 What proportion of the services offered by the university is less than 3-5 years old? Describe the most significant changes.
I.6 What strategic steps have been taken to further advance the university?
I.7 How does strategy/innovation contribute to the development of resources and staff so as to render the implementation of that strategy feasible? Describe the current situation and planned long-term development.
II. Networks

II.1 What network development strategy does the university pursue in its relationship with other universities and academic institutions, businesses, and other organisations?

The networking idea has shaped the identity of ESB Business School. It is the initiator of the international academic network "International Partnership of Business School, IPBS", starting with collaborative study programmes of Reutlingen, Reims and London in 1979, is one of its hallmarks. These “pilot”-programmes have been the starting point for the creation of an international partnership network of 10 IPBS-Degree-Partners and more than 110 international partner universities (status in 2014).

ESB enjoys the support of the company network V.I.M.A. (Verein zur Förderung der Internationalen Managementausbildung e.V.), which is dedicated to the promotion of quality in international management education. More than 45 prestigious international companies are at the heart of the organisation and their long-term commitment includes not only financial support, but also advisory services, teaching as guest lecturers, company-based project seminars and career options for students and graduates.

Long-term commitment and trusting relationships are the underlying principles for cooperation put into practice by active engagement of the faculty members. The networking strategy is reflected in corresponding organisational structures supporting cooperation and exchange: contractual agreements based on aligned aims and quality standards sustain stable frameworks for joint activities (e.g. for student and staff exchange, for double degree programmes, research cooperation). The Knowledge Foundation@Reutlingen University contributes to connecting ESB Business School to the educational demands of the business world. ESB resources (staff and budget) are dedicated to networking activities and services (e.g. head of internationalisation, Career Centre, Alumni).

The Business School and the university are members of established academic networks and members of selected national and international university associations.

The cooperation with national and international partner universities is based on the quality of cooperation: fitting of mission, sustainability of partnership perspectives, programme and research compatibility with ESB Business School’s aims are relevant issues of partnerships. ESB Business School manages its international university partnerships professionally and continuously by
• defined processes and quality criteria for the election of partner universities in accordance with planned activities such as student exchange, double degree programmes, faculty exchange etc.;
• managed database of partnerships and cooperation agreements;
• focus on reciprocal exchange relationships with partner universities and mutual benefit for both parties;
• evaluation and discussion of internationalisation strategies in expert groups (managed by the head of internationalisation at ESB);
• membership in international quality networks: AACSB, EFMD (European Foundation of Management Development), CEEMAN (Central and East European Management Development Association) UN Initiative PRME (Principles for Responsible Management Education);
• membership in international university associations: CLADEA (The Latin American Council of Management Schools), Deutsch-Französische Hochschule, IPBS-Business School Network.

The cooperation with companies is based on four cornerstones:
• Expertise from the business world: Faculty members have gained at least five years of experience outside the academic world and often continue to cooperate with business partners; most of them act as liaison persons connecting ESB Business School and companies.
• Curriculum development: The study programmes include practice oriented content provided by visiting lecturers; internships and final theses in cooperation with companies are a crucial element of ESB Business School's practice oriented curricula;
• student careers and recruitment: the cooperation between ESB Business School and companies opens up career opportunities for students and graduates and allows companies to recruit qualified personnel.
• Knowledge transfer: ESB Business School is invigorated by living exchange relationships with business partners and emphasises reciprocal benefit. It offers services to companies by providing options for recruitment, alumni catalogues, publication of job-, thesis- and research offerings. Academic experts are offering consulting to companies or organisations on request and are partners for tailor-made collaborative projects and trainings.

With the establishment of the Knowledge Foundation@Reutlingen University (KFRU) in 2008 a professional management of further educational programmes was institutionalised. The maintenance of stakeholder relationships is organised by its executive director as well as by the heads of currently 14 institutes under the roof of KFRU. In regular meetings of the advisory board of ESB Business School and the Foundation the spectrum of stakeholder expectations are discussed to develop future perspectives for continuing education.

The alumni network is the starting point of life-long cooperation in a world-wide network. The alumni association is one of the strongest institutions in Germany with more than 4,200 active members and global reach. The information network connects and informs the members and the interested public about activities of alumni (e.g. entrepreneurship), expert forums or lectures, international cooperation and current events.

ESB Business School, as a part of Reutlingen University, is an active agent involved in regional development and the regional educational and labour market. It has always been and continues to be a relevant point of contact for medium-sized companies and international players of the region for junior staff recruitment, human resource development and knowledge exchange. Reutlingen University and the Business School are offering expertise and response to questions from the side of business, politics or public interest. Faculty members and students are motivated to engage in active citizenship including social projects.
Regional engagement and impact of ESB Business School is reflected in the close cooperation with the chamber of commerce (IHK Reutlingen), with whom extensive exchange has been established at board level, especially in regards to entrepreneurship and start-ups. One of the current projects in this area is the establishment of a start-up lab at ESB with IHK providing additional staff and funding. ESB’s start-up initiative and entrepreneur’s club have lend the Business School forerunner status in municipal start-up development with institutional counselling being contributed by IHK.

Additional regional engagement is displayed by the various projects initiated and conducted by the Business School’s student consulting association. Within the framework of this student-driven and faculty-supervised initiative, numerous projects have been completed serving the community and city of Reutlingen especially in the area of infrastructure planning, logistics and education. Another prestigious regional project is the current reconstruction of the city’s freight terminal which receives technical and project support and counselling from the schools business engineering department. This project will transform the former depot into a container and logistics centre. Similar local and regional and impact of the school is contributed to, and documented, by way of various honorary engagements pursued by ESB faculty.

Exchange between the Business School and regional companies is also maintained by regular company visits which allow to link theory and practice. Knowledge transfer is also achieved by including external lecturers into teaching and vice versa, by ESB Business School professors teaching in other institutions than Reutlingen University.

II.2 How does the university cultivate its networks?

The networking activities of ESB Business School are actively initiated and managed and cover a wide range of fields such as

- The national and international academic field:
  - proactive role in self-governance committees within the university and at the interface with external players in the field of educational policy;
  - discussion and agreements within the frameworks of academic institutions (e.g. Dekanekonferenzen, commissions (Beiräte, hochschulpolitische Ausschüsse) and expert groups (Hochschul- und Fachverbände));
  - participation in existing university networks and creation of new university cooperations (e.g. “Alpenallianz”, connecting MCI Innsbruck, ZHAW Zürich and ESB Business School in order to set up projects, business models, faculty exchange etc.);
  - cooperation in research (international, e.g. EU-projects);
  - guest lectures by renowned experts (e.g. Sachverständigenrat der Deutschen Wirtschaft, World Bank etc.);
  - individual memberships in various expert commissions (e.g. Bundesverband deutscher Ratinganalysten und -advisor BdRA, International Network for Economic Research (INFER), Bundesvereinigung Logistik BVL e.V. etc.);
  - close cooperation with international partners;
  - membership activities within international university and Business School networks (e.g. EFMD, AACSB).

- Business relationships:
  - Cooperation in the area of human resource development (recruitment of graduates, training workshops by companies for students and vice versa corporate trainings by university for employees);
  - internships and thesis projects in companies, applied research;
  - consulting (both directions);
  - endowed professorship (Stiftungspfessur) and shared professors (part-time professorship);
• involvement of business partners as board members, in student admission procedure, professorship appointment procedures;
• close cooperation with associate lecturers and adjunct faculty (from companies and from other universities) including lecturer day, services for lecturers such as IT support, training programmes;
• scholarships (e.g. Deutschlandstipendium, DAAD grants (Deutscher akademischer Austauschdienst));
• tailor made study and training programmes and executive trainings for companies.

Alumni e.V. activities:
• website and social networking platform including database, job portal and graduate catalogue, newsletter;
• regular meetings of local graduate groups worldwide, annual alumni weekend, homecoming day etc.;
• mentoring programmes;
• feedback processes, involvement in strategic management discussion.

c.

public:
• information events on study programmes and student recruiting activities: information day with lectures, open house presentation ("Tag der offenen Tür"), information for international students, information by school ambassadors etc.;
• organisation of conferences, round table and podium discussions (e.g. annual business forum “Wirtschaftsforum”);
• management and analysis of social media;
• information in press and media (e.g. in Manager Magazin, Handelsblatt, regular one-pager in local press); contribution to publicly discussed subjects such as sports marketing, financial markets, economic principles etc.;
• graduation ceremonies in town hall with multiple international guests.

II.3 How does the university assess the outcome of its networking activities, and what outcomes does it aim to achieve in the future?

The networking activities generate a relevant benefit and value for ESB Business School and are a driver for its development. The assessment of networking can be based on quantitative indicators:
• ESB maintains active partnerships with more than 110 partner Universities;
• offers 10 double degree programmes (and 3 programmes with double degree options);
• holds regular meetings of all IPBS-Partners twice a year;
• maintains cooperation with more than 45 supporting corporate business partners;
• hosts professionally organised company fairs managed twice a year;
• has more than 4,500 active alumni all over the world.

The more important indicator for the Business School’s networking impact is, however, the quality of its networking activities and relationships and its potential to influence. Sustainable partnerships based on mutual consent and reciprocity of interests are the basis for international cooperation. Networking structures, anchored in the organisation of ESB Business School and supporting services contribute to the maintenance of relevant alliances. A close coordination of activities and continuous communication assure that projected aims and outcomes can be achieved. The exchange of knowledge and arguments also includes discussions and constructive criticism leading to reasonable and innovative solutions.

In general, the overall network activities of ESB Business School contribute substantially to the performance in the following areas:
• profile, visibility and positioning of ESB Business School;
• international cooperation programmes;
• global employability of graduates;
• applied development projects in teaching and research.

The valuation of the effects of specific networking strategies is difficult, due to overlapping fields of activity.

The Business School contributes to the promotion of international and academic education and plays an active role in the educational field. Collaboration in the field of research to promote synergies and to strengthen ESB Business School’s applied research potential is one of the most challenging aims of strategic development. Intensified collaborative efforts are planned to win tenders and to raise funds for research and development projects. The collaboration with universities shall also include further collaborative programme development, PhD-programmes and cooperation in developing innovative teaching methodologies. The further expansion of knowledge transfer and tailor-made course programme development will be another field for cooperation with companies as well as with educational partners. An overall strategic focus for networking activities is to advance the internationalisation of ESB Business School.

II.4 What effect do the university’s networks have on its internationality?

The international networking of ESB Business School right from the beginning provided the school with a clear competitive edge to the School. The challenge persists to further develop international competitiveness and to play an active role within international University networks. Major achievements are:

• a coordinated international partner management including compatibility with mission and course offerings, granting stable and trusting working alliances.
• Internationally compatible qualification framework: ESB study programmes including corporate programme curricula are structured according to international standards of educational levels, including admission and progression criteria.
• Credit transfer and recognition: The school defines and disseminates its policies for evaluating, awarding, and accepting transfer credits/courses from other institutions (e.g. by Learning Agreements).
• Quality management: International quality criteria for ESB Business School have been adopted in the course of AACSB-accreditation-process. Partner universities are regularly included into internal and external evaluation processes (accreditation and internal audit).

Quality standards are included in cooperation agreements. International networking, based on both, individual and institutional cooperation, is fundamental to ESB Business School’s positioning and profile. It is the basis for stable working alliances for student exchange and international programme management. Worldwide networks facilitate academic and work experience for students. Networking allows benchmarking ESB Business School’s performance against comparable institutions and challenges the school to adopt international quality standards. Networking alliances are, moreover, a pathway to win internationally renowned international partners. Networking also contributes substantially to the open-minded spirit of students and faculty, an outstanding mobility and intercultural sensitivity acknowledging the importance of a global perspective.

II.5 What role does client/stakeholder orientation play with regard to the university’s networks?

The inclusion of stakeholder’s perspectives into ESB Business School’s management processes, communication and cooperation represents a relevant self-assessment criterion. ESB Business School regularly collects information about stakeholder demands (e.g. by surveys for applicants and students, by enquiries among alumni, employers and professionals
and by exchange with Partner Universities etc.) to get feedback from its “clients”. The organised and informal feedback processes play a crucial role in identifying success factors.

Stakeholder satisfaction is seen to be fundamental for trust and reputation of the Business School. ESB Business School is also aware of its “third mission” and is dealing with questions such as regional impact and knowledge transfer by collaborating with e.g. with the Chamber of Commerce (Industrie und Handelskammer), social entrepreneurship by students’ projects, responsible citizenship and engagement and thus strengthens its local and regional commitment.

Networking at ESB Business School connects different stakeholder groups and provides platforms for exchange (e.g. coaching of students by alumni, student admission process including HR experts from companies, student ambassadors providing information for schools, etc.).

A directed customer relationship management informs and addresses specified target groups. The management board of ESB Business School communicates with internal and external stakeholders and decision makers in regular meetings and reports. ESB Business School developed active and valuable interactions within its networks and within the framework of its stakeholders which rely on deepened engagement instead of quantity.

**Appraisal:**

According to the panel the cooperation and network partnerships of ESB correspond completely with the strategic concept of the Business School. ESB can look back on 35 years of successful cooperation with foreign partner universities. The cooperation leads to the joint implementation of double degree programmes as well as mutual student and lecturer exchange (regarding the scope of lecturer exchange see chapter B. SWOT-Analyses).

Furthermore ESB cooperates with a considerable number of regional, national and international companies (e.g. through the company network V.I.M.A.). The contacts with companies are used for guest lecturing, projects and seminars, as well as connecting companies and students/graduates for career opportunities. The cooperation is also used for research on behalf of companies or by students who write their theses about topics and by using information of business partners.

The same appears for the work of the Knowledge Foundation. Via this institution ESB offers study programmes whose profiles and competence goals were defined in cooperation with companies and therefore oriented towards the needs of the business partners.

Other participants of the network are the alumni of the Business School who are organised in the alumni association with its high amount of members and various very well accepted activities in several countries.

The panel appreciates that the networking activities of ESB comprise regional cooperation (e.g. with IHK or the town Reutlingen) as well as national and international cooperation (Companies and Higher Education Institutions). The internationality is also shown in the membership of quality networks like AACSB.

A large number of staff members are involved in expanding and maintaining the network. For every cooperation a specific person is responsible. The resulting accessibility for the partners is very good and was much appreciated by the foreign partners of ESB who took part (via video call) in the interview during the site visit.
Altogether, the university works intensively with partners to foster and extend an extensive strategic network and practices close cooperation on several levels.

**Criteria Networking**

II.1 What network development strategy does the university pursue in its relationship with other universities and academic institutions, businesses, and other organisations?

II.2 How does the university cultivate its networks?

II.3 How does the university assess the outcome of its networking activities, and what outcomes does it aim to achieve in the future?

II.4 What effect do the university’s networks have on its internationality?

II.5 What role does client/stakeholder orientation play with regard to the university’s networks?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quality requirements</th>
<th>Exceptional</th>
<th>Exceeds quality requirements</th>
<th>Meets quality requirements</th>
<th>Does not meet quality requirements</th>
<th>Not relevant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II 1</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II 2</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II 3</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II 4</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II 5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

III. Teaching and Learning (Contents/Didactics), Research

**III.1 Teaching and Learning**

III.1.1 How does the university implement its strategy in its curriculum, and what perspectives for the future result from this?

ESB Business School’s programme portfolio is developed according to its international focus, as well as academic and labour market demands. The programmes are clustered in three pillars representing the characteristic study tracks:

- X: programmes comprised in the X pillar allow students to study in two countries, either starting at ESB Business School and continuing abroad or the other way round.
- Y: means that all students start at ESB Business School and specialise either in elective majors or in studies abroad.
- H: programmes allow students in Operations Management to combine business and engineering subjects and to specialise both in their Bachelor’s and their Master’s programmes in either production or logistics management.

Programme portfolio:
Curriculum aspects common to all ESB programmes:
In its mission statement ESB Business School has put forward the key aspects that are common to all ESB programmes and at the same time differentiate ESB from other universities:

- **International focus:** graduates of ESB programmes have been prepared for working in an international, cross-cultural business context. They gain personal experience in living and working abroad, co-operating with peers from other cultures and can communicate in at least one foreign language. ESB curricula therefore integrate phases of studying and/or working abroad, language skills are further developed in compulsory language classes, intercultural management aspects are part of curricula.

- **Application orientation:** graduates of ESB programmes know how to apply theoretical concepts and tools in business practice. They master typical business problems of varying degrees of complexity and can identify promising solution alternatives. ESB curricula therefore make students familiar with general business concepts and theories as well as with the domain-specific tools and instruments that are needed to solve business problems. Curricula contain internship phases, company projects, lab exercises and make extensive use of case studies.

- **Leadership competencies:** graduates of ESB programmes are effective communicators and know how to motivate other people towards common goals. They take initiative and know how to manage teams and projects. ESB curricula therefore integrate classes on oral and written business communication, leadership skills and project management. Curricula expose students to self-administered project work and give opportunity to present own ideas and solutions (presentation, group discussions).

- **Responsible business actors:** graduates of ESB programmes have been made familiar with concepts of corporate social responsibility (CSR), they can reflect ethical implications of business decisions and act accordingly. ESB curricula therefore integrate ethics and CSR and give students the opportunity to apply and reflect these concepts in various occasions (case studies, company visits, student projects).

Undergraduate and graduate programmes implement these common traits in different ways into their curricula and add programme-level specific aspects as outlined in the next section.

ESB undergraduate programmes are offered in two domains: general management with an international focus (IPBS and IB programmes) and business engineering (IOM programmes). All undergraduate programmes award a Bachelor of Science degree. Undergraduate level
curricula all include quantitative methods (mathematics, statistics, operations research in varying complexity) and business information technology. Undergraduate programmes prepare students for an international career by integrating compulsory internships (one semester minimum, two semesters in some programmes) and compulsory stays abroad (study semester, internship abroad). Adding compulsory language classes ESB undergraduate curricula build students’ strong international profile. General management programmes (IPBS and IB) integrate all core business disciplines in their curricula and offer a choice of electives / majors for students to select a personal specialisation area. IOM programmes combine the major business disciplines with a comprehensive education in operations management (focus either on logistics/SCM or on production management).

ESB graduate programmes expect applicants to show a profile that is similar to an ESB Bachelor graduate at the time of application (international focus, language skills, strong application orientation). Graduate programmes build on this profile and add a programme-specific special focus, thus building a unique programme profile:

- Programmes IAT/IBD are specialised business Master programmes in international accounting and taxation or international business development, respectively;
- MBA programmes (offered full time and part time) target graduates with non-business degrees and personal work experience;
- The Master in Operations Management (MOM) is heavily project-focused, its curriculum is built around two semester-long operations management projects.
- The Master programmes MIM (International Management) and EMS (European Management Studies) further extend students international management profile by integrated stays abroad and a multi-lingual study environment.
- ESB offers a variety of corporate programmes at the Master level that combine students’ work experience with a further deepening in a specialised discipline (process management, sales management, retail management etc.).

All ESB study programmes are in line with the National and the European Higher Education Qualification Framework, defining binding standards for all academic levels. This quality framework defines

- formal curriculum requirements such as admission requirements (academic and professional) and scope of Bachelor’s and Master’s programme levels;
- Qualification outcomes stating what students are “expected to know, understand and/or be able to do” at the end of their studies.
- the framework provides characteristic descriptors distinguishing the expectations for Bachelor’s from Master’s programmes. The differentiation is based on the acquired dimensions of knowledge, the complexity of problem solving skills, the degree of executive competences and the extent of communicative and social skills.

The outcome descriptors encompass the dimensions of subject specific, generic, social and personal competences. Accordingly, content of the curriculum, teaching methods and assessments are aligned with these expected outcomes. The quality assurance for ESB curricula will make sure that study programmes comply with these level-specific requirements of the National and European Qualification Framework.

ESB mission goals and ESB curricula structure are reflected in a variety of learning experiences for ESB students. Application orientation is ensured by:

- internship phases with mentoring and colloquia for reflection and further guidance;
- lab exercises (finance lab with online, real-time access to financial market information, lab facilities in electrical engineering, automation, computer-aided design for operations management students);
- computer lab facilities with standard software suites for continuous practising;
- integration of case studies, company projects and compulsory field trips and simulation games in individual modules and curricula. All programmes are internationally oriented
with an ambitious workload and focus on student employability. Undergraduate programmes at ESB Business School include one or more semesters abroad. On the graduate level, ESB offers consecutive programmes, as well as MBA programmes and part-time corporate programmes. The school specialises in double-degree programmes that have been running successfully for thirty years now with ten international partner universities.

In accordance with the educational mission of ESB Business School, one key learning goal shared by all degree programmes at the Business School is related to the immersion to practice. ESB’s programmes are designed and delivered to facilitate the utmost exposure to national and international business practice and to create corresponding learning experiences within each programme. Correspondingly, a large variety of experiential learning opportunities are embedded in curricula, culminating in at least one compulsory internship and a thesis project required for graduating from any ESB degree programme.

ESB study programmes include optional modules or choices and allow to personalise career opportunities. Outgoing students may opt for specific partner universities abroad to focus on selected international or academic experience. Students choose and are exposed to a broad variety of activities which contribute to their character development valued by future employers. Curricula in Bachelor programmes display a balanced share of theoretical and application oriented learning. The latter one being facilitated by case studies, simulations, group projects, field trips, and presentations to industry representatives. Programmes with logistics and engineering foci require lab work and projects. The recently established finance lab allows students to work with professional standard software and database solutions commonly used in the finance and banking industry.

Graduate curricula feature the same application-oriented methodologies and pedagogies, though at a more complex level. This holds especially true for case studies and lab and project work. In MBA programmes, professor’s academic input is naturally strongly tied to the professional field of individual students. (Bachelor and) Master candidates are actively recruited by industry partners for thesis projects through the school’s career service and it is common practice that professors share their industry contacts with students.

III.1.2 How are the high-quality acquisition, selection, and guidance of students supported/ensured?

ESB Business School degree programmes have a clearly defined admissions policy for all Bachelor's and Master's programmes consistent with its strategic goal to attract “highly qualified applicants who, after completing their studies, aspire to fulfil challenging roles in companies and organisations in an international context”. According to these aims, ESB Business School has formulated programmatic admission criteria for all applicants as well as formal admission standards and regulations for each of its study programmes. Sought-after applicants are strong on analysis, socially committed, multi-lingual, and internationally oriented. All programmes strive to achieve a diverse student body in full compliance with equal opportunities legislation. Key selection criteria are:

- international orientation and language proficiency in at least two languages and
- social and personal skills evidenced and applied in practice.

ESB Business School’s admission policy includes a deliberate and restrictive selection process for all applicants prior to admission. It is based on defined and programme-specific regulations and selection procedures. These regulations are in line with legally binding admission requirements for undergraduate and postgraduate level applicants.

ESB Business School addresses and attracts both national and international Bachelor’s and Master’s applicants. Applicants at all levels are informed about the necessary requirements (formal and qualitative) for their application and all relevant documentation such as selection
procedure by-laws are available online. There are university wide (International Office) and programme-specific (programme coordinators) support services to assist international applicants in the process.

An admission committee for each single study programme is responsible for the recruitment process, the enrolment decision and the evaluation and development of the selection process. It reviews and develops the admission criteria to make sure that the qualifications of the admitted students are consistent with the goals of the study programmes. Therefore they are considering study progression and career development of graduates as well as the feed-back of stakeholders.

Admissions are formally issued by Reutlingen University whereas ESB Business School nominates the selected candidates for admission. The number of applications to ESB programmes regularly exceeds the number of available capacity of the programme. Numbers of applicants, numbers of selected applicants and intake of students starting the programmes are key data/KPI monitored by ESB Business School. The admitted student body is in general sufficiently qualified to complete the intended degree within normal time-to-degree. 90% of graduating students complete their studies within regular time-to-degree. Deviations are usually effected by additional internships or study abroad semesters.

Bachelor’s candidates are expected to demonstrate, in addition to their formal eligibility to higher education, language skills in at least German and English, a high motivation and soft skills verified in the application process. All Bachelor’s applicants are required to submit a written application verifying their formal higher education entrance qualification. The overall final grade is rated; it has to be at least “good” and in general, the qualification level which grants admission may be higher.

The Curriculum Vitae and supporting documents for additional qualifications have to be included (e.g. school visit or other stay in foreign country, professional experience, social engagement, awards etc.). All applicants to ESB Bachelor programmes pass a compulsory or optional test and/or an interview and are assessed on the basis of a standardised evaluation scheme. The interviews with applicants are headed by an ESB Professor; to ensure objectivity and expertise, a second faculty member or a professional expert is involved. The final selection is based on a ranking list of applicants. Admission criteria for ESB Master’s programmes are selective regarding the

- formal requirements such as the first academic degree, language proficiency, professional experience, and
- personal and social competences of candidates.

The ESB consecutive masters mainly recruit highly qualified external applicants who graduated from German or international universities. They have to present a first academic degree of a minimum of 6 Semesters (180 ECTS-Credits) or equivalent. They have to be proficient in all programme-specific languages of study, in general German and English, except for those programmes exclusively taught in English. For MBA Programmes, a minimum of two years of professional experience is a compulsory entry requirement. Requirements for admission to Masters programmes correspond to the overall mission of ESB also on programme level. Thus, the expectation of international experience and professional insight is a basic precondition for studies, but differs among programmes; compulsory prerequisites are documented in the admission regulations. Applicants for Master’s programmes are expected to demonstrate a successful career profile including and at least a final grade marked “good” of their first degree. Personal and social competencies are verified via application documents including CV and a motivation letter or interview.

Key elements of the assessment scheme are: subject specific and interdisciplinary competences, international and intercultural competence, social and communication skills such as problem solving and leadership competencies. Applicants for ESB corporate
programmes need to pass a double verification procedure; on the one hand they will be selected by the employing companies according to their HR development goals and, on the other hand, they will have to fulfil the general academic admission criteria (including an interview with professors of ESB).

ESB Business School attracts excellent international students from all over the world, mainly due to long-lasting international partnerships, its international alumni and the reputation of its international programmes. The school strives to extend the International recruitment of qualified candidates e.g. by offering full programmes or parts of it in English language; in these programmes German is no prerequisite for admission. Students can be enrolled as exchange students for a limited period of one year or admitted to the study programme as degree-seeking students. The qualifications of exchange students are checked to fit with the programmes they apply for, whereas degree-seeking students fulfil the ruling admission requirements of the programmes. Candidates from abroad are supported in the application process wherever necessary.

The overall ratio of international students is (in Summer 2014) 30.3%; whereas programmes like International Management Double Degree and European Management Studies easily reach ratios above 40% and International Business (English language Bachelor) attracts more than 32% of international students. Numbers of applicants and total student numbers at ESB Business School are increasing, particularly in Master’s programmes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enrolment by Degree levels (Winter term 2013/14)</th>
<th>Reutlingen University</th>
<th>ESB Business School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Full-Time</td>
<td>Part-Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor</td>
<td>4,190</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master</td>
<td>1,128</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Programs</td>
<td>--</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>5,318</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The admission policies of ESB Business School are clear, well-communicated and consistent with the commitment to offering internationally oriented and research-informed learning experiences to qualified applicants who are likely to succeed as students and graduates respectively. In order to further align selection and admissions processes with ESB’s mission and to improve counselling and support proposals for students it planned to make admissions criteria and procedures even more visible and easily accessible on new ESB website and to analyse evaluation results in regard to time-to-degree more systematically.

III.1.3 In what way are corporate social responsibility, knowledge transfer, and extracurricular contents taken into account by the university’s teaching and strategically moved forward?

With respect to ESB’s mission statement, the school’s objective is:
To have a values-driven shared vision and service approach for all stakeholders which is based on mutual trust and respect, individual commitment and shared responsibility towards our local and global stakeholders. We need to ensure that the vast majority of ESB members are familiar with and subscribe to the ESB spirit which encompasses:

- honest academic conduct, accountability, fairness, objectivity and integrity;
- open communication and cooperation and acknowledgement of diversity;
- advancement of the academic community and its mission, including high professional standards.
The corresponding initiative transfers ESB’s shared values of respect, trust, responsibility and commitment into everyday academic practice and campus life. The school encourages ethical behaviour and maintains a collegiate environment which allows for interaction in learning, scholarship and community engagement. The initiative also addresses the requirement that the school must have processes and financial strategies in place to provide resources appropriate to and sufficient for achieving this mission and corresponding action items. A task force was constituted to address the following subjects:

- review financial and capacity resource plan;
- establish code of conduct and ethics committee, include faculty, staff, students, external bodies and alumni, define sanctions;
- design and establish proposals and activities to foster ethical behaviour e.g. ethics week, lecture series, workshop on ethical decision making etc.;
- reinforce initiative “ESB Kultur” to create and secure a collegiate environment through shared values;
- finalise guidelines for professional leadership (HSRT initiative);
- review HR development plan, mentoring and performance review proposal with measures to ensure faculty and staff are held accountable for their behaviour;
- reinforce performance review process;
- enable admissions for and reach out to minorities or disadvantaged students.

Faculty’s engagement in professional and international activities (consulting, research, conferences, memberships, teaching exchanges etc.) allows students to broaden their perspectives beyond the classroom. The active involvement of adjunct faculty in self-governing activities of the faculty is contributing to significant interaction with students and colleagues. ESB plans to further strengthen adjunct faculty’s involvement in the schools processes and is preparing a “participating faculty” initiative to be started in the academic year 2014/15.

Knowledge exchange and interaction between classroom and “real life” is an element which is included in all study programmes e.g. by guest lecturers, company projects, visits of companies and organisations.

All ESB curricula employ teaching and learning models which require students to work in teams and offer opportunities for students to learn from each other. Module courses have a maximum attendance of 35 students, most courses are below this. Students are encouraged to adopt changing roles (team players, managers, leaders, moderators, negotiators) in the generally international student groups.

Extra-curricular interaction is provided for by numerous activities and events students and faculty engage in at a high frequency. These range from interdisciplinary projects, business campus fairs or the participation in the numerous competitions, to charity and other initiatives which contribute to what is generally referred to as “the ESB spirit”.

Outside the classroom, ESB students are extraordinarily active and engage in a variety of business-practice related activities. Besides programme-specific activities and engagement, most of the regular and once starting initiatives are open to all ESB students and partly involve students from other schools. All activities and student societies comprised in the ESB Student Network are organised in “Ressorts” (divisions). Elected student representatives maintain a standing commitment with the school laid down in a written agreement between the school management and the ESB student network.
III.1.4 How (considering the university’s strategic and outcome orientation) is the content-related and didactic quality of the curriculum supported/ensured, measured, and strategically moved forward?

The introduction and revision of degree study programmes at the Business School is first of all a strategic decision, discussed among board and faculty as well as with university board and with external stakeholders. Responsible for the introduction and revision of programmes is the Dean of studies, supported by the respective programme directors and the quality assurance team of ESB Business School. The ESB Board has issued school-wide programme guidelines outlining the strategic, generic criteria that have to be met by all study programmes (e.g. match with ESB vision, complement to ESB study portfolio, prove of sufficient resources, etc.). These guidelines are continuously updated to reflect possible changes in the academic and administrative environment and are distributed among all faculty members.

The introduction or, respectively revision process of degree programmes study programmes is determined by internal and external regulations, operates along the lines of a standardised quality assurance process and is informed by the school’s key stakeholders. The process to be followed when developing a new or revising an existing study programme is defined in ESB Business School’s quality management handbook and by guidelines of the University.
The school has implemented a system of regular internal programme audits in order to systematically review programme concept and structures. The audit is realised under the supervision of Reutlingen University’s general quality assurance function. ESB quality team prepares an audit plan outlining the timing of all programme audits. This plan is approved by ESB Board and communicated to faculty members. These audits together with other frequently employed quality assurance tools (class evaluations, graduate surveys, student feedback in programme council meetings etc.) are the main tool to identify points for improvement in individual study programmes. Audit results are discussed with programme teams and documented in an audit report. This audit report is used for tracking implementation of identified improvement actions.

Since its inception this internal audit process has been applied to five different study programmes (school resources suggest a frequency of approximately two programmes per study semester). Typical points for improvement in these internal audits are inconsistencies in module weights and workload, insufficient descriptions of learning outcomes or lack of documentation of changes to the programme.

Curriculum design for ESB Business School programmes is outcome oriented. This means that content and methods of programmes are based on the learners’ perspective, while the teaching process contributes to students’ acquisition of encompassing and multidimensional knowledge, skills and competences. Thus curricula are regularly revised in the way that single courses, teaching and assessment methods are aligned with the intended overall outcomes of programmes. ESB Business School is aware that this process needs continuous attention.

ESB Business School’s qualification schemes are compliant with national and international qualification frameworks. These regulations provide a fairly tight framework on minimum and maximum number of credits (student workload) for individual curriculum elements (e.g. thesis or internships), differences between undergraduate and graduate programmes or minimum levels of quality assurance per programme and for the school in its entirety. These frameworks for distinguished qualification levels also define corresponding qualitative descriptors for
expected learning outcomes. The definition of learning outcomes in higher education has become a topic of debate and there are various competing approaches. ESB Business School adopted a model including common denominators of this discussion encompassing the following dimensions:

- discipline related knowledge, subject-specific competences (theory and methodology, scholarly research, problem solving expertise in the field, etc.);
- methodological competences (multidisciplinarity, professional qualification, information management, international competences etc.);
- social competences (team work, social responsibility, intercultural competence, communicative competences etc.);
- personal competences and key competences (self-awareness, target orientation, decision-making ability, time management etc.).

Intended learning outcomes are published in the overall programme description and they are translated into curriculum components, e.g. by including semesters abroad, internships, projects and cases, by implementing competence based teaching methodology and assessment procedures.

ESB Business School’s study programmes build on defined quality objectives regarding teaching and learning. They range over content-related to structural dimensions: compulsory elements for all study programmes are international and practice-oriented features and a broad interdisciplinary qualification with options to specialise. Teaching methods and assessment procedures are to be regularly revised to make sure that they adequately enhance learning processes and qualify students for the labour market and, in general, for complex, continuously changing tasks.

The employment of certain teaching methods and delivery modes vary among ESB degree programme levels in accordance with the respective learning outcomes. A compulsory internship in all programmes exposes students to business practice and allows for the application of theoretical content to real life business problem solving. Teaching in undergraduate programmes traditionally involves a larger proportion of face-to-face teaching and guidance for the students than in graduate programmes. Undergraduate teaching also features closer feedback processes. The programmes include in general external lecturers (mostly native speakers) to teach in language courses as well as experts providing instruction to information and knowledge management (e.g. from library or IT-department). Being also responsible for overall student progression, professors and programme coordinators stay informed about upcoming problems and the efficiency of delivery modes.

Graduate programmes focus on student-centred learning. Teaching includes a wide-ranging methodology from laboratory work to complex case studies. Students are enabled to develop a high degree of autonomy and are encouraged to solve research tasks in groups. Professors contribute their academic and professional experience and the continuous improvement of teaching is influenced by developing academic standards.

The delivery mode in MBA or corporate programmes naturally builds on the professional experience of students. Professor’s academic input is strongly tied to the professional field and students in general bring in not only their academic but also their interdisciplinary (and often international) knowledge. The teaching methodology includes the analysis of transferability of knowledge, feasibility questions and the development of student’s careers and leadership.

ESB recognises the increasing importance of modern information and communication technologies in business practice. Curricula therefore integrate modules in computer science at the undergraduate level. Programmes at all levels use an electronic learning platform (Moodle) for information exchange and class work. ESB has initiated an “innovative teaching and learning” initiative in 2013 and has continued working on this topic since then. The goal is
to further intensify the use of modern I&C technology both in classrooms and in phases of self-study. Several pilot projects have been started in 2013 and 2014, respectively (MOOCs, interactive simulation games via distributed electronic platform).

As of winter semester 2008/09 Reutlingen University has been evaluating the quality of teaching across all courses delivered once per term. Responsible is the central quality management and the quality management officer of the university following standardised processes regulated by the statutes of the university evaluation by-laws. Centralised evaluation ensures that:

- survey procedures and contents are standardised;
- the process is transparent;
- workload for all schools and faculty is minimised;
- the collection and analysis of high quality data is ensured;
- evaluation results can be compared across programmes and over time.

The aim of centralised course evaluation is to engage students by way of an anonymous questionnaire the results of which feed into in the evaluation and development of courses. The Business School has introduced additional surveys for international students covering questions aiming at gathering information on the learning experience of incoming students.

Data obtained from evaluation serves faculty members as feedback to their teaching and helps identify areas of improvement. Results are also used by the schools and programme development committees in an aggregate form to develop curricula.

Evaluation results are made available to all faculty members for their own courses and professors receive teaching evaluations of adjunct faculty teaching in their modules. In case, course student ratings differ significantly from the average value or open comments give reason for clarification, the quality assurance officer of the university initiates a dialogue among concerned parties and suggests options for quality improvement measures. Each semester, the Dean of Studies of the Business School prepares an evaluation report which encompasses primarily course-wide ratings. The Faculty Board and the Dean evaluate results and suggest measures directly into the study programs such as workload adjustments or quality and coordination of events. Teaching evaluation and especially the survey questions addressing pedagogies and delivery modes (“Didaktik”) yield stable and positive results across ESB degree programmes. Student’s feedback to corresponding questions in the evaluation survey evidence that:

- ESB courses follow a clearly identifiable learning path;
- the learning atmosphere is positive and productive;
- courses and delivery modes enable active participation and student engagement
- pedagogies and methods employed are adequate and facilitate learning and student progression.

Curriculum management at ESB Business School is closely monitored by approved quality assurance processes. A plan-do-check-act-cycle has been implemented for the development of new curricula, including the evaluation of curricula structures and content by different experts (according to European and national quality standards). Programme directors are in charge to manage compulsory and suggested improvement measures. The process of regular internal audits makes sure that the loop is closed and that improvement measures have been successfully implemented into curriculum development.

Closing the loop is likewise an institutionalised process applying for teaching evaluation. Appropriateness of the taken measures is monitored by continuous analysis of teaching evaluation and is summarised in the evaluation reports in the responsibility of each of the programme directors.
In order to implement a systematic and sustainable assurance of learning system, ESB will base the assurance of Learning process on a broader base than currently exists. Established bodies within ESB are either focused on individual programmes (e.g. programme directors – “Studiendekane”) or cannot devote sufficient time and attention to AoL due to a variety of other duties (e.g. ESB Board). The goal of the new body is to provide strategic guidance and advice to ESB Business School with regard to attain prospected learning outcomes.

The Curriculum Committee (CC) is conceived as an advisory body to the school’s management functions. Its main focus is to ensure strategic alignment of the school’s programme portfolio with its mission and the expectations of internal and external stakeholders. The CC advises the ESB Board, the ESB school council (“Fakultätsrat”) and the assembly of ESB programme directors (“Studiendekanekonferenz – SDK”) in all strategic and “cross-programme” curriculum matters such as:

- development of new or discontinuation of existing study programmes, as well as modifications to existing programmes;
- alignment of programme portfolio with stakeholder requirements (employers, applicants, Ministry);
- integration of new learning/teaching concepts in methodologies in curricula;
- initiation of ESB-wide strategic AoL activities (e.g. introduction, development and implementation of new AoL instruments);
- alignment of programme learning goals with ESB mission and vision (“curriculum maps”);
- alignment of ESB programme portfolio to external developments such as demographic change, changes in the higher education landscape, employability requirements, etc.

The curriculum committee evaluates AoL results that are reported by individual study programmes and/or central school functions. The committee can suggest changes to a programme’s curriculum, modifications to learning goals at the programme and/or module level and checks progress with respect to the implementation of past committee suggestions. The CC is not directly involved in day-to-day operational processes and decision-making. These remain within the remit of the ESB Board, school council and individual programmes, respectively. The committee meets, at least, twice a semester. Additional meetings can be requested by the ESB Board or by the school council.

The CC is a new body that complements existing functions and bodies at ESB Business School.

While the AoL process focuses on direct, measures, ESB Business School also employs a broad range of indirect measures and outcomes to assess teaching performance and efficiency of its programmes. A relevant feed-back on qualifications of students and graduates comes from the side of employers in the context of internships, company-related thesis projects or recruiting activities assessing mainly employability, but also successful acquisition of key competences.

A regular survey, asking recent graduates for an overall retrospective assessment of their studies provides information on satisfaction with gained competences and on transition into employment. Graduates are, over the last years, reporting a broad enhancement of their qualification, the relevance of international experience and of a practice-based and focused learning. To a characteristically larger extent than average graduates they start an international employment and are rewarded slightly higher wages. This is verified by ranking results derived from enquiries including students and business managers.
III.1.5 In what way are international aspects taken into account by the curriculum, and how for the students’ development; how are they further developed strategically.

Currently, the school offers a wide portfolio of international programmes with foreign study and internship possibilities, tailored to the main stakeholder requirements. Not all students want to invest so much time in foreign studies, particularly if they have gathered an array of international experience prior to application and/or are international degree-seeking students. They may opt to choose a shorter, less integrated route to a double degree or even to a fast-track Master programme. Those not interested in a double degree can still choose to study at international partners or conduct a foreign internship. All undergraduate programmes include, at least, one mandatory semester of foreign study. Moreover, many include an integrated foreign internship. With respect to Master programmes, some flexibility has been introduced to accommodate for work needs or the fact that students have gained considerable international experience at the undergraduate level. Whatever the case, study abroad is an integrated part of all curricula whereby students are expected to pass agreed modules matching programme-specific criteria.

Internationalisation works two ways. A wealth of international students (degree-seeking and exchange) can be seen on the ESB campus. The international spirit at ESB Business School can be experienced in a multifaceted way on the campus. Students communicate fluently in several languages, cooperate in multinational teams and learn from changing perspectives.

Internationalisation is strategically managed and coordinated by the head of international relations of ESB Business School. Internationalisation is a distinctive and core element of the School’s mission and concrete aims and measures have been defined to further develop this profile.

The following agreement on objectives have been included in the 5-year development plan (SEP) of ESB Business School (among others).

- The percentage of international students in ESB Bachelors programmes should be at least 30%. Master programmes define the portion of international students according to their target group strategy.
- International content is to account for over 50% of the curriculum and be covered in every subject through special intercultural seminars as well as practical examples, exercises, and case studies in an international context.
- Depending on the degree programme, at least 25% of the curriculum should be in a foreign language and for some degree programmes this should reach up to 100%.
- All undergraduate students at ESB Business School should spend at least one semester abroad. The student exchanges are to be organised, supervised and coordinated with integrated curricula.

Internationalisation initiatives only make sense if they meet the business and academic needs of our stakeholders. An important aim with regard to internationalization is to focus on strategic partnerships. This has involved the introduction of a stringent selection procedure for the establishment of new partner cooperation agreements. The purpose is to assess the overall significance of a partnership for the school, as well as the potential for extending any given agreement to more than one study programme.

Learning agreements with partner-universities are reviewed regularly. Due to the increasing mobility rates of students, recognition procedures for qualifications from other institutions will possibly need a more standardised quality assurance process to facilitate and promote international studies.

Professors of ESB Business School are encouraged to engage in guest lecturing at international universities. A minimum target number of international credit hours to be delivered
by the school was defined. Moreover, each programme is expected to send out and welcome, at least, one faculty member for teaching purposes per year.

Language learning is an important cornerstone of ESB Business School curricula. As a result, one of the school’s strategic goals states that depending on the degree programme, at least 25% of the content should be delivered in a foreign language.

To keep up with the challenging international educational market and to fortify ESB Business School’s international profile the school will be active to promote:

- further internationalisation of curricula and student body will take place (student intake, admission policy);
- quality of services in the area of internationalisation will be of a high quality and in line with the general expectations of stakeholder;
- international research network will be formalised, extended, supported and tracked to ensure it is aligned with the ESB mission and shapes teaching and practice;
- staff mobility (research, teaching & professional staff) will be fostered in line with ESB mission;
- sustainability of internationalisation initiatives.

III.1.6 How is the students’ transition into professional life and their subsequent development supported/ensured?

The ESB Career Centre coordinates the industry contacts at ESB Business School with the aim of providing students with an optimal choice of future employers and career opportunities. Services to students include:

- career consulting and application coaching for students including application training workshops;
- organisation of two annual campus recruiting fairs: International Business Fair (IBF) with approx. 80 exhibitors and the ESB Firmenforum (FiFo) with approx. 40 participating companies;
- company presentations, workshops, lectures and panel discussions,
- online job exchange for internships, thesis projects and job offers including the option to rate internship providers;
- weekly electronic newsletter with information about recruiting fairs, workshops, competitions and guest lectures;
- career coaching proposals offered in cooperation with ESB Alumni.

ESB students make ample use of the career services available. In particular attendance and frequency of alumni workshops doubled from 2012 to 2013 and the number of individual or group consulting sessions conducted by career service staff increased by 38% in the same period. More than 300 students participated in company fair Warm-Up Weeks, ca. 50 workshops, lectures, discussion evenings per year were organised, the database on job offers its at present approximately 2,600 internship offers, 700 job offers, more than 250 part-time job offers and 120 topics for theses.

Ranking and survey results frequently attest ESB study programmes a high degree of practice orientation and commend ESB’s graduates above average employability. The services of the career centre are regularly evaluated both by companies and employer, e.g. following the company fairs on the campus and by students via the teaching evaluation which includes feedback on ESB services and the graduate survey. The career centre itself assesses its own performance by key indicators such as number of job offering as mentioned above as Evaluation results are communicated and included in the improvement process.
III.1.7 Advice and support currently provided to the students

Student counselling and learning support is a vital service throughout the entire student life cycle.
ESB students are guided throughout their course of study and have specific points of contact for their questions or concerns. Main areas of student counselling are:
- guidance and advice at the beginning of studies;
- advice on organisational matters and curricular questions;
- advice on all matters relating to exams, internships and terms abroad;
- advice for students in special and/or difficult situations.

Responsible for student counselling is the Dean of study, responsible for the operational implementation are the programme coordinators of the individual study programmes. These are supported by central functions such as the Career Centre at ESB and other specific functions available through the central university administration, especially the international office (RIO). Counselling services are provided both from the side of the university and from the side of the Business School and cover a wide range of issues from formal, organisational questions over learning methodology to career services. A primary contact point for Student Counselling is the Student Service Centre of the University. Centralised offerings are also provided by University, student union (“Studierendenwerk”) and by third parties. These include sports programmes, cultural activities, interdisciplinary courses, psychological assistance and assistance in difficult situations e.g. for disadvantaged, grants, housing etc.)

ESB Business School’s dedicated staff members provide invaluable student support for both academic and extra-curricular activities and directly contribute to the educational mission. The average student – faculty ratio in degree programmes is about 1:40, with even more favourable ratios in the MBA and corporate programmes. Full-time and participating faculty outweighs supporting faculty and the engagement of professors is partly facilitated by reduction of teaching obligations. Services accompany programme organisation and comprise all standardised processes and procedures which assure smooth operation of a degree programme. This includes for all ESB programmes:
- planning of degree course schemes and curricula;
- planning of student timetables;
- organisation of orientation weeks, reading weeks, company visits and excursions;
- alignment with partner schools’ curricula etc.

ESB Business School and Reutlingen University offer a broad range of support services to assist students to successfully compete their studies. These are e.g.:
- administrative and academic staff for each of the study programmes to provide advisory services throughout the student life cycle;
- orientation and buddy programmes for international students;
- language and business communication courses to improve required language proficiency;
- support of the learning process in the area of time management, soft skills, academic writing etc.;
- online courses and tutoring;
- mentorship by alumni.

Special attention is paid to assistance and counselling for international students. Introductory weeks help with organisational questions and with integrating into new or existing classes. Welcome packages containing relevant information is provided for all newcomers. Advice for international students is of increasing importance at the Business School requiring programme coordinators to not only be fluent in English, but also to demonstrate intercultural competence and awareness.
Consulting for individual student’s progression problems is offered at various levels (including subject specific professor’s support, organisational advice and support in case of personal/social problems). With a considerable international student body, language proficiency especially in German is essential in regard to student integration and progression. Hence, ESB works in close cooperation with the Reutlingen International Office (RIO) which offers a wide range of German language courses for all international students. The semester courses are offered at all levels from beginners to advanced. Business German and online courses are also available. These courses are free of charge and ECTS credits are awarded for most of them.

The aim in supporting student progression is to offer the best individual career options. The ESB Career Center and the ESB Alumni organisation, one of the largest of its kind in Europe, comprehensively support students in their individual careers.

Up-to-date infrastructures, a completely renovated Learning Center (“Lernzentrum”) and extended support and offerings for IT-supported teaching and learning have been a central focus of development over the last two years. ESB Business School has – with the support of project and company funding – set up laboratories and technical infrastructures for teaching and learning purposes that are outstanding for a small institution such as Reutlingen University. Most visible result of its efforts to innovate is a new campus building to be opened in 2015 providing additional space primarily for ESB Business School’s operation management students.

All of the previous also applies to staff operating the five master’s programmes offered by the Knowledge foundation. KFRU staff comprises of the foundation’s director, two programme managers, five programme assistants and one financial administrator. KFRU employees have access to all services and proposal including personal and professional development opportunities offered by the Business School and the university respectively.

**Appraisal:**

The Business School has a clear and convincing procedure of admission which ensures that qualified students are enrolled in the study programmes. That the admission procedure is well-thought-out can be seen in the involvement of the specific admission committees for each single programme. In addition the process differs for the levels of studies. The single parts of the admission process like tests, interviews or motivation letters appear reasonable to choose between the applicants. Requirements regarding the language skills of applicants are in line with the international orientation of the study programmes as well as of the Business School itself. The number of students who successfully complete their studies in time shows that the implemented system works well.

ESB Business School integrates subjects like Corporate Social Responsibility, business ethics and sustainability into the curricula and relates them with decision making processes. Altogether, the panel formed the view that the transfer of the shared vision and values of ESB works very well.

Via regular audits the Business School checks on the study programmes and the outcome orientation. In addition, evaluation – internal (e.g. students) and external (e.g. employers) – structured feedback or surveys are carried out continuously. The definition of competencies with regard to the different levels (Bachelor/Master) as well as different study concepts (regular Master/MBA) is convincing. Regarding didactical methods the panel agrees with ESB that information and communication technologies are getting more and more important. Therefore, the panel appreciates the “innovative teaching and learning”-initiative that ESB has implemented. Overall, the panel came to the conclusion that the internal quality assurance system (following the PDCA-cycle and including components like the Assurance of Learning-
concept or the curriculum committee) is particularly convenient to guaranty that certain standards are fulfilled and that the system promotes further development (see also chapter IV).

International aspects are clearly taken into account in the study programmes of ESB. The several double degree possibilities as well as regular student exchange or the possibilities of internships abroad prove the various activities. Regarding the further development of its internationalisation the Business School defined precise objectives and documented them in the development plan. The panel formed the view that international aspects in the teaching and learning activities of ESB meet the business and academic needs of all interested parties. The mission-driven international dimension of all bachelor's and master's programmes is evident in all relevant aspects. Specific objectives have been documented in the development plan and promise to further strengthen internationalization of ESB.

Student counselling covers all phases of studies. Services are provided by several organs like the Student Service Centre or the International Office. Regarding the students’ transition into professional life and their subsequent development the Business School has established its Career Centre. The available services seem very appropriate to connect the students and graduates with companies and organisations as potential employers.

Criteria Teaching and Learning

III.1.1 How does the university implement its strategy in its curriculum, and what perspectives for the future result from this? Indicate the various programme types (BA, MA, Doctorate, professional training) and forms of study (full-time, part-time, dual academic/practical programme) on offer.

III.1.2 How are the high-quality acquisition, selection, and guidance of students supported/ensured?

III.1.3 In what way are corporate social responsibility, knowledge transfer, and extra-curricular contents taken into account by the university’s teaching and strategically moved forward?

III.1.4 How (considering the university’s strategic and outcome orientation) is the content-related and didactic quality of the curriculum supported/ensured, measured, and strategically moved forward?

III.1.5 In what way are international aspects taken into account by the curriculum, and how for the students’ development; how are they further developed strategically.

III.1.6 How is the students’ transition into professional life and their subsequent development supported/ensured?

III.1.7 Describe the advice and support currently provided to your students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quality requirements</th>
<th>Exceptional</th>
<th>Exceeds quality requirements</th>
<th>Meets quality requirements</th>
<th>Does not meet quality requirements</th>
<th>Not relevant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.1</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.2</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.3</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.4</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.5</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.6</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.7</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
III.2 Research

III.2.1 What form does the university's research strategy take, and which key performance indicators are used to validate its successful implementation?

With respect to ESB’s mission statement, the ESB Business School defined the following guidelines: “To leverage the international expertise of faculty to conduct innovative, relevant teaching and applied research that shapes business practice we need to maintain a diverse and international faculty and student body that enriches teaching, advances the boundaries of scholarship and applied research and informs international practice. ESB Business School’s degree programmes should be competitive, interdisciplinary, and practice oriented.”

ESB Business School recognises the growing relevance of research activities for universities of applied sciences on the background of programmatic statements of the “Federal Ministry of Education and Research”, or regional development initiatives. ESB Business School and Reutlingen University improve research performance by strengthening the factors:

- research infrastructure;
- human resource development and incentive system;
- collaborative research projects;
- raising of third party funds;
- research-friendly environment (Forschungskultur) and visibility of research performance.

ESB Business School defined its research focus in the structure and development plan 2012-2016 (SEP) as following:

- ESB Business School is committed to applied research and development, according to its institutional status of a university of applied sciences.
- ESB Business School promotes research in the interdisciplinary fields of business management and operations generating impact on practice or contributing to knowledge transfer.
- Research activities and results are transferred into curricula to ensure relevant and state of the art content for all study programmes.
- Research activities shall be substantially extended by 2017, supported by a research supportive climate and infrastructure.
- An increased number of cooperative PhD procedures and the employment of research assistants are seen as instruments to promote research and to evoke multiplier effects.
- Available means for research shall be attributed in a balanced way to support research, curriculum development, teaching and learning and self-governance.

ESB Business School continues to shift its vision towards a greater emphasis on research. Accordingly, faculty are expected to continuously contribute to the school’s research portfolio. This is on one hand a de jure requirement of the University legislation and has been introduced by the faculty salary model (W3-professorship, which ties individual salaries to a professor’s research output and the procurement of third party funding). In 2014 ESB Business School appointed three new professors, all of them being research professorship positions (W3).

On the other hand Universities of applied sciences are not (yet) supported by adequate infrastructure (such as assistant professorships, scientific support staff, reduction of teaching load, research rewards) and research activities were, up to now, mainly based on individual effort. In the context of appointing new faculty, the Business School therefore attributes great significance to appointing colleagues with a proven research record whose work is closely related to the school’s key research areas.
Reutlingen Research Institute is the first point of contact for faculty seeking assistance or guidance in their research projects. The University issues guidelines related to quality and scientific standards of contributions and, in alignment with the aforementioned legislative requirements, introduced a bonus system based on the assessment of quality of publications. Reutlingen University also awards the “University research award” for distinguished projects and scholars.

Standard indicators to assess research outcomes are applied (e.g. including research ranking parameters and reporting standards of the ministry), these are: sum and source of third party research funds, growth of third party funding, research expenses, number of publications, number of publications per professor, patents, number of collaborative PhD theses.

A core element to promote and support research activities was established by ESB Business School in 2013: the incentive system FASY (Forschungsanreizsystem) offers financial support by way of:

- subsidies for publications (translations and print or publishing costs);
- reimbursement for publisher’s fees in peer review processes;
- subsidies for conference attendances which involve a paper, presentation, panel or related engagement activity;
- funding for research project assistants.

In addition to rewarding bonusses for demonstrated outcome these advance payments of ESB faculty can be a stimulation element within the developing research environment.

II.2.2 How does the university implement its strategy in its research activities, and what perspectives for the future result from this?

The challenging research standards for International Business Schools are for ESB Business School the starting point for developing a research profile consistent with its mission, expected outcomes and strategies. ESB Business School developed short-term goals and future oriented long-term strategies and perspectives to align its research concepts with the standards set by the international accreditation agencies.

ESB Business School’s research strategy emphasises three focus areas:

- the commitment to applied research and development focuses on problem-solving research outcomes and immediate benefit for defined target groups and impact on practice;
- research activities closely connected to teaching and learning in order to advance scholarly research in business, management and operations;
- engagement in knowledge transfer projects, providing expertise, training and consulting

Reutlingen Research Institute (RRI) is the central scientific facility of the University and coordinates all research and development activities of the University’s five schools. Research projects are clustered in research centres and groups according to research foci. The University research commissioner, who is a full-time professor at the Business School, also serves as research officer for ESB. As a school belonging to a university of applied sciences and in alignment with its mission, ESB’s research output has a strong application- and integration-orientation. The transfer of research results into teaching is e.g. achieved by project based teaching, real case projects, research internships and theses.

Key research areas of the Business School are:

- logistics and supply chain management;
- international management and
- innovation management.
ESB faculty members conduct research projects with industry partners, national and international fellow researches or research centres such as Fraunhofer-Gesellschaft, Europe’s largest application-oriented research organisation. Current national and international research projects at the Business School are:

- **LOPEC – Logistics Personal Excellence by Continuous Self-Assessment**;
- **Logistics Learning Factory – An innovative study programme model to enhance practical relevance in logistics management**;
- **NIL – Network of Innovative Learning-Factories**;
- **RobLog – Cognitive Robot for Automation of Logistic Processes**;
- **VETC: Virtual Engineering and Training Centre – Methods and tools for sustainable factories, production systems and warehouses, consulting, research and training**;
- **QUEST 3C – interdisciplinary simulation game devised for business engineering students**.

The logistics projects are bundled in the Logistics centre and include an encompassing technical and IT-infrastructure (such as VIS-Table to plan logistic processes and 3D-Virtual Lab). These projects receive substantial funding through various bodies such as the “Life Long Learning Initiative” of the European Union, the German Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF), Fraunhofer-Gesellschaft or the German Academic Exchange Service.

Relevant individual or, respectively, team-based research, applied research and development of ESB Faculty has taken place in areas such as Macro Economics and Monetary Theory (including research at MIT and for the German “Sachverständigenrat zur Begutachtung der gesamtwirtschaftlichen Entwicklung”), Finance and Rating, Sports Marketing etc. The Business School keeps its research portfolio up to date in a newly implemented database comprising faculty portfolios, intellectual contributions and research projects, and publishes an annual research report in order to systematically collect, manage and evaluate faculty qualification.

The spectrum of intellectual contributions produced by ESB faculty is wide with significant publication records relating to finance, logistics, management and marketing.

While the quality of contributions is assessed in the course of the aforementioned University bonus system, the Business School is currently defining a process to assess the impact of individual contributions produced by faculty. Prospective impact indicators will be:

- publication in nationally or internationally ranked journals;
- level of circulation;
- citation counts;
- number of editions;
- adoption of research results in curricula and teaching.

The corresponding qualification and review procedure is conducted by the “ESB Faculty Qualification Committee”.

ESB Business School’s task forces dealing with academic excellence and quality and with teaching and research impact developed action items in order to push immediate development and to develop further and future perspective as following:

- establish periodical meetings of academic discipline groups (“Fachgruppen”) to compile a catalogue of teaching topics
- provide for faculty sufficiency and effective deployment;
- implement scholarship and research policy: define Intellectual contributions and desired impact, criteria and portfolio
- roll-out software implementation to keep track of research and teaching activities of all faculty members (also adjunct faculty);
- further develop research funding scheme and manage incentives and rewards system, research awards;
establish „LFZ Lehr- und Forschungszentrum“ a Logistics Teaching and Research Centre for ESB to strengthen practice-oriented research and teaching
- establish international research network;
- set up ESB staffing plan for all programmes based on status of faculty members.

III.2.3 How are research findings included in the university’s teaching and in the knowledge transfer to third parties, and what strategy is this based on?

According to its mission ESB Business School engages in applied research and development focused on transferable outcomes. Faculty, staff and students work on projects contributing to problem-solving in industrial and business companies. This applies especially to for faculty in the area of operations and logistics management, but also in the areas of marketing, finance and strategic management.

Curricula at ESB, especially Master’s programmes, include company based project learning and internships in companies, organisations or research institutions as a preparatory phase for thesis projects. Thesis deal with real case solutions and quite frequently fitting outcomes are implemented into practice.

ESB Business School and Reutlingen University offer expertise and research support for mission oriented and contract research for third parties. Participating in bidding procedures (on one’s own or together with partners) is supported (e.g. by Reutlingen Research Institute) and it is intended to enhance cooperative transfer projects. Transfer of knowledge is also provided by consulting and services (e.g. in economics or business law). This allows, in return for the faculty, the acquisition of up-to-date knowledge and know-how. The university grants sabbaticals to the faculty to conduct applied research and to contribute to the two-way knowledge transfer.

Knowledge transfer among the scientific community is achieved by participating in expert forums, conferences and associations; most of the faculty is actively engaged in these forms of cooperation. Knowledge transfer to public institutions and the society is achieved by participating in societal and political debates (e.g. on sustainability, business ethics, poverty, diversity etc.), by Studium Generale and other public lectures, by informing the media and by engaging for responsibly fulfilling its educational mission.

To transfer research activities and results into teaching is a major objective of ESB Business School’s research strategy. The generally (and especially in research universities) loosely coupled areas are interconnected by several factors:

- Professors are engaged in both research and teaching to a balanced (and non-hierarchical) extend.
- Their teaching is research-informed and thus includes content-development.
- The transfer of research into student-focused teaching provides students with research methods and knowledge and stimulates critical thinking processes.
- Research based teaching includes the discussion, absorption and transmission of content: this knowledge transfer process is essential to the learning process.
- Research and teaching are interrelated by involving students in both areas by creating a dialogue and knowledge exchange in both directions.

Research, teaching and learning are not regarded as separate fields and take place everywhere across the faculty. It is intended to actively connect research and teaching and two main initiatives have been set up to underpin this goal: the learning factory and the already mentioned “Lehr- und Forschungszentrum” (LFZ). Furthermore, and this is a second cornerstone of further development, knowledge transfer is institutionalised in the functions of the Knowledge Foundation at Reutlingen University. Certificate and degree-granting courses and programmes, customised or adjusted to defined learning outcomes are offered to qualify
employees. The part-time studies allow an immediate transfer of knowledge into day-to-day professional life.

III.2.4 How is the relevance of the university’s research ensured, and what direction will strategic development in this field take in the future?

ESB Business School has set defined goals for research and is continuously evaluating and developing its implementation strategy. ESB Business School decided to adopt AACSB accreditation standards for faculty requiring that faculty have and maintain qualifications and current expertise to meet and support ESB Business School’s mission and goals. Faculty members are expected to keep their knowledge of their field of teaching, management and research up to date. We seek to foster a permanent dialogue between the faculty, students, professionals and scholars of other universities worldwide.

This dialogue ensures that new trends in research and management are discovered and discussed within the faculty. Dialogue in the academic field is maintained by intellectual contributions, dialogue on the professional field by management activities. As a university of applied science, ESB Business School does not want to separate academic and professional activities. In contrast, ESB Business School wants to ensure that theory and practice enrich each other.

To make sure that each faculty member keeps “up-to-date,” faculty members are asked to inform annually about their scholarly and professional activities over the last five years articulating how these activities demonstrate currency, quality and impact. That will happen in a three-step system:

- As a first step, the faculty member reports his scholarly and professional activities over the last year to the Faculty Qualifications Committee (FQC). The FQC is a new entity within the faculty created to assure quality and impact of professional and scholarly activities. Members of the FQC are the Dean, one member of the Board, ESB’s research officer and one member of the accreditation task force. The faculty member is responsible for justifying the significance and impact of his or her portfolio of activities.
- On the second step, the FQC evaluates the faculty member’s activities. The FQC checks whether impact of his scholarly activities is demonstrated by the faculty member’s statement and requests for further information if classification is unclear.
- The third step comprises the classification of faculty members by evaluating the impact of their single scholarly or the professional activities.

The classification of faculty distinguishes the following qualification profiles: Scholarly Academics (SA) sustaining currency and relevance through scholarship and related activities, Practice Academics (PA) sustaining currency and relevance through professional engagement, interaction, and relevant activities, Scholarly Practitioners (SP) sustaining currency and relevance through continued professional experience, engagement, or interaction and scholarship related to their professional background and experience, and Instructional Practitioners (IP), sustaining currency and relevance through continued professional experience and engagement related to their professional backgrounds and experience.

III.2.5 How is the quality of the university's research measured and ensured?

Formalised criteria to evaluate research at ESB Business School and Reutlingen University are effective at different levels:

- by evaluation of research proposals, development plans, projects and scheduled activities preceding projects
- regulations and criteria applying to current projects,
• evaluation of outcomes and impact of research (summative assessment).

Evaluation of research, up to now, has been included in individual projects and has only in some aspects been reviewed in an overall perspective. Specified evaluation procedures are on the way to systematically be implemented in the last few years. The aim is to track efficiency, operative performance and structural improvement. The evaluation of research proposals is in most cases included in the bidding procedure; peer review makes sure that projects are adequately planned and staffed to attain the expected outcomes.

Ongoing projects are governed by monitoring progress, allocation of funds and reporting. A regular reporting process hereby is an annual reporting of the Reutlingen Research Institute to the Ministry of Baden-Württemberg, according to standard regulations.

Reutlingen University has laid down its own code of practice to ensure that scientific endeavours are of high quality, and commits its scientists to follow it. The “liaison officer” of the university, nominated by the senate is the contact persons to provide guidance and to deal with violation of good practice in scholarly research. The code of conduct regarding research (“Regeln zur Sicherung guter wissenschaftlicher Praxis”) is binding for all university members. Peer-review procedures: The full potential and the significance of peer review and has not been tapped by now. The position in research rankings or ratings based on bibliometric indicators will have to be examined as well as finance indicators to allow comparative results.

PhD options in cooperation with University partners will be a relevant asset for this purpose. The school’s academic staffing policy will focus on the appointment of research-active candidates and will continuously develop new research foci, such as marketing and finance, with corresponding teaching and research centres to be established. In addition, adjunct faculty active in research will be more narrowly attached to the faculty.

Incentive system (FASY), bonuses and agreement on objectives, as described above will be the supportive measures for sustainable research. The faculty qualification committee will be in charge to further develop appropriate and motivation measures to enhance research and to unfold a faculty wide, consistent strategy by defining focus areas and priorities.

The evaluation of outcomes and impact of research (Wirkungsanalysen) mainly relies, at present, on feedback from involved third parties or final evaluation report feedback of funding institutions (such as the European Commission etc.). The international accreditation expects a much more detailed investigation of the impact of research, including in depth discussion and evaluation as well as the demonstration and documentation of evidence.

Appraisal:

ESB pursues an explicit research strategy which is embedded in the structure and development plan of the Business School. The Reutlingen Research Institute (RRI) was implemented to coordinate the research activities. To achieve the strategic goals for research the Business School takes measures like appointing new professors in W-3 positions. Furthermore for all professors the implemented incentive system shall help to increase the amount of research activities.

The panel came to the conclusion that ESB has development potential regarding its research activities. ESB Business School faculty members stated that at Universities of Applied Sciences budget constraints prevent them to establish a substantial research infrastructure. Thus, research activities are mainly initiated by the efforts of individual professors and have to be shouldered alongside the regular teaching load. Once again the panel points out that there is a risk of overstretching the human resources (see also chapter I). Nonetheless, in the view of the panel the application oriented research activities which are currently done by ESB’s staff
are of high quality (but the panel has some doubts that fundamental research can be realised due to the limited resources and the restrictions set by the university type). Through documents delivered by the Business School during the site visit the panel was convinced that the taken measures for increasing third part funding are already very successful. The panel learned that ESB checks the outcomes of the research activities primarily on the basis of published articles and external funding. If the Business School follows its strategy to increase the research activities the panel recommends using alternative measurement methods.

National and international industry partners, organisations and ministries are actively involved in the research projects and provide third party funding. This involvement ensures the relevance of the application-oriented research.

The panel came to the conclusion that transfer of findings from research into teaching (especially into Master programmes) occurs on a systematic basis (e.g. company based projects or these; learning factory and Lehr- und Forschungszentrum). Via the three-step system the Business School is regularly informed about the research activities of the faculty members. Besides the research activities lecturers can attend conferences and congresses.

**Criteria Research**

III.2.1 What form does the university’s research strategy take, and which key performance indicators are used to validate its successful implementation?

II.2.2 How does the university implement its strategy in its research activities, and what perspectives for the future result from this?

III.2.3 How are research findings included in the university’s teaching and in the knowledge transfer to third parties, and what strategy is this based on?

III.2.4 How is the relevance of the university’s research ensured, and what direction will strategic development in this field take in the future?

III.2.5 How is the quality of the university’s research measured and ensured?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Subcriteria</th>
<th>Quality requirements</th>
<th>Exceeds quality requirements</th>
<th>Meets quality requirements</th>
<th>Does not meet quality requirements</th>
<th>Not relevant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.2.1</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.2.2</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.2.3</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.2.4</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.2.5</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IV University Dynamics

IV.1 What approach does the university pursue in order to actively or reactively deal with changes within its environment or to pro-actively shape its environment?

ESB Business School commits on one hand to a focused and forward-looking strategy and on the other hand reacts to upcoming needs, conflicts or opportunities and thus manages long-term, medium-term and short-term developments differently. Long-term strategies such as the Bologna Reform Process, the faculty merger, establishment of the Knowledge Foundation or key research projects are planned in a close coordination with all relevant stakeholders and these projects are sustainably anchored in corresponding institutional structures.

Core element of the medium-term strategy is the strategic development plan SEP 2012-2016. The objectives and strategies of ESB Business School are connected to the overall strategy of Reutlingen University and are complemented by school-specific aims. Mission and vision are specified and aim to develop an outstanding international profile and to further comply with international quality standards. The mission explicitly aims at increasing the attractiveness of programmes and to promote diversity, equal opportunities and responsible behaviour of all faculty members. Further areas for development are:

- promotion of autonomy and accountability in governance principles;
- the continuous improvement of measures to approach excellence in teaching and learning;
- the enhancement of research, further education and knowledge transfer;
- the improvement of infrastructure;
- human resource development;
- internationalisation and cooperation;
- customer-orientation;
- transparency and communication.

A continuous coordination and interaction process between University, its faculty members and their social environment and stakeholders ensures that problems and requirements are perceived and taken into account (there is a wide range of examples from integrating current economic questions into curriculum), responding to qualification needs of companies, reacting to change of student’s mentalities (“Generation Y”).

A key element for development is the quality-driven approach and principles of ESB Business School. Its internal and external self-assessment processes have contributed to a widened perspective on development issues and allowed to include changing framework conditions. The adoption of quality criteria relevant for the systems accreditation process and for international accreditation have been drivers for substantial development concerning process management (e.g. including a compulsory quality check for changes in the programme portfolio and curricula) and self-directed improvement in areas such as teaching methods and inclusion of research.

Short-term strategies are driven by a strong motivation to innovate, to develop and to improve. This is best represented by the various day-to-day activities of all faculty members, which all contribute to the lively spirit of ESB Business School. These activities are appreciated and communicated on the web and in an internal monthly newsletter of ESB Business School.
IV.2 Does the university initiate change processes on its own initiative?

A proactive management approach has been a characteristic trait throughout the history of ESB Business Schools. Within its institutional framework – which has for a long time been regulated rather strictly – ESB Business School’s management board and faculty have developed a strong entrepreneurial spirit, which is strengthened by extensive experience in innovation and change processes. A set of favourable framework conditions contributes to ESB Business School’s ability to initiate change:

- short communication channels due to a relatively small and transparent organisational structure;
- leeway for faculty- and discipline-specific structures and processes (e.g. ESB by-laws; ESB advisory board and alumni etc.) due to the subsidiary organisation of Reutlingen University (in which ESB Business School often adopted a pilot function);
- stimulation of ideas by an intensive collaboration with trustworthy partners and by competition;
- short and efficient decision paths driven by a strong management board;
- intensive information flow including regularly scheduled meetings;
- support for individual creativity and initiative (e.g. concerning research projects, partnerships etc.).

ESB Business School promotes the proactive development of study programmes and has successfully revised the bachelor’s portfolio, with the Master’s portfolio to follow. The school has established innovative corporate programmes and has thereby reached new target groups. Lifelong learning will be one of the areas that will be further developed likewise by the university and the Business School.

The initiative for innovation may come from individuals (e.g. new teaching methods) and become an impulse for other teachers. Other innovation is implemented across the faculty school, impacting all programmes (e.g. faculty qualification and outcome-oriented curriculum structures and content).

New projects are, in general, regarded to rely on collective efforts though accountability is in general clearly defined and reliable management structures are established. Nevertheless ESB Business School characteristically builds on creative initiators and promoters, on individual engagement and commitment to move forward. ESB Business School contributes to national and international discussion groups in the educational field and participates in academic, political and public debates.

IV.3 How does the university’s quality management system ensure the continuous and systematic development of the university?

Derived from its mission statement, ESB Business School has established quality goals which are part of the long-term quality strategy and represent the basis of the quality management system. Seventeen individual quality goals have been defined and categorised into three groups: content related, formal and resource-related. These quality goals are published in the Quality Handbook of ESB Business School. ESB Business School developed and published its SEP in a separate document: “new perspectives 2012-2016”. ESB Business School also contributes to the overall SEP of Reutlingen University with a school-specific appendix.

The quality goals of ESB Business School are closely entwined with the strategic quality goals of Reutlingen University. On an operational level, two full-time and one part-time quality and accreditation officers, headed by the Dean of Studies, are responsible for quality matters. In addition, the quality management officer of the university is involved in internal audits and review processes of the Business School.
ESB Business School’s Quality Management (QM) relies on a process-based model with clearly defined goals and responsibilities and including a continuous improvement process (CIP). It is designed to assure and improve quality in all processes within the student life cycle, as well as the school-wide management and support processes.

Quality Management System of ESB Business School:
The QM system actively supports the strategic goals of ESB Business School, reflects the organizational structure of the Business School and comprises all functional areas and intersections.

The QM of ESB Business School complies with the European Standards and Guidelines for Quality assurance and includes a P-C-D-A-Cycle for improvement measures, while allocating these plan-do-check-act-functions to defined positions.

Quality management and quality assurance apply the following instruments:
- programme development driven by quality management system including process management;
- Key Performance Indicators;
- self-assessment;
- teaching evaluation;
- internal audits and peer review;
- external audit, national and international accreditation.

The following chart outlines the interaction of the quality management with ESB process and programme management.

Quality Assurance at ESB Business School:

Programme development is governed by three underlying principles: conformity to given external quality regulations and internally agreed quality standards; structured documentation, and process management. These measures ensure that programmes can be accredited, that
all relevant stakeholders were or are involved and that evaluation results were taken into account in order to implement improvement measures.

The curriculum structure, teaching and learning and assessment procedures are outcome oriented. Quality assurance derives measures to verify the attainment of goals. Assessment methods include teaching evaluation, graduate survey and the newly developed Assurance of Learning process as well as interactive feed-back processes in various committees and with the involvement of all concerned parties.

An internal audit process includes:
- self-assessment report and documentation of the study programme based on the programme audit questionnaire;
- analysis of the results of evaluation measures according to the Reutlingen University evaluation statutes (Evaluationssatzung);
- analysis of criteria for the accreditation of study programmes according to the German accreditation council (e.g. qualification goals and programme structures, workload, assessment, cooperation, resources, documentation, efficiency of processes, development measures);
- selected indicators from the core process of teaching and learning as they relate to the programme;
- evaluation of initiated corrective and development measures.

Internal audits are conducted according to an audit plan agreed with the Management Board and issued by University Reutlingen quality management.

The QM system is described and published in the Quality Handbook, complemented by an annual quality report and an evaluation report per term by the Dean of Studies.

ESB Business School has attained German national institutional accreditation in 2013. Holding the institutional accreditation seal the school has to make sure that all national and supranational (e.g. European Union) quality standards are being met (European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in Higher Education, guidelines of the Standing Conference (KMK) and the criteria of the Accreditation Council). The system accreditation was conferred for six years including an interim review.

In support of ESB’s internationalisation strategy, which includes pursuit of international accreditation, Reutlingen University joined AACSB as a member in 2009. In June 2013 the school’s eligibility application for initial AACSB accreditation was accepted and a mentor was assigned. Following an initial gap analysis, the Standards Alignment Plan (SAP) was set up. In October 2014 the SAP was accepted by AACSB and alignment efforts at present focus on faculty qualifications, intellectual contributions and impact, and assurance of learning.

ESB Business School regularly analyses its management performance by using different analytic instruments. Progression is tracked by a “traffic-light system” assessing achieved outcomes on the basis of a timescale. This applies for the strategic development plan of ESB Business School and for some of its medium-term projects. ESB Business School introduced a balanced scorecard to ensure alignment of everyday operations with the school’s mission and the internationalisation strategy. The school’s mission identifies four key strategic focus areas on which it concentrates its efforts. It actively professes commitment to:
- producing socially responsible graduates who are highly employable worldwide;
- achieving academic excellence in accordance with international quality and educational standards;
- forging strong international and sustainable partnerships;
- leveraging the international expertise of faculty to conduct innovative, relevant teaching and applied research that shapes business practice.
Each of these focus areas comprises concrete targets. Some targets are quantifiable and clearly measurable; others are rather qualitative. Performance and goal accomplishment are tracked using a variety of KPIs and instruments. The realisation of individual goals in sum should lead to the attainment of the overall aim of the target focus area. In an attempt to guarantee quality and facilitate achievement of targets, a variety of measures and initiatives have been defined and implemented. Within the balanced scorecard individual initiatives are assigned to the different scorecard perspectives: finances, internal business processes, learning and growth, customers and markets. By operationalising the strategy in this way, ESB Business School gains a clear overview of which measures are being implemented to realise the mission goals and to which degree.

The evaluation of management performance by way of a balanced scorecard and the quality management system are controlling instruments which are used to identify strength and weaknesses and to anticipate necessary adjustment measures.

IV.4 What measures does the university use to promote the continuous development of its employees and organisation within the framework of the university's strategy?

ESB Business School aims to be an attractive employer and to attract and retain qualified faculty and staff. High quality, diverse and engaged staff, dedicated to the mission of the school is a success factor of ESB Business School.

The recruiting and appointment procedure for professors follows defined regulations concerning qualification (including substantial professional experience) and, moreover, focuses on international experience, commitment to quality teaching and research motivation. ESB Business School supports the advancement of these qualifications not only concerning faculty but also including staff.

All new faculty participate in the University and ESB Business School induction processes. Initial procedures include being allocated to a mentor, an initial induction checklist that provides staff with support in completing initial procedures in order to gain access to the full range of university support services. Staff and faculty alike have access to and are being regularly informed and updated on relevant processes, guidelines and checklists such as information on teaching workloads, reductions, sabbaticals etc. All documentation is available and accessible via the ESB or university intranet pages respectively. Coaching and professional mentoring for new faculty is also offered by the university HR department. Further guidance is provided by way of proposals such as “New Prof Day” or the Professors’ Plenary Meeting taking place once a semester.

ESB faculty are expected to keep abreast of developments in their field on an ongoing basis, and to continuously develop their pedagogic skills. The university offers faculty support to attend academic conferences, provides for sabbaticals, offers academic seminars, and actively promotes the sharing and review of good practice. Also at the university level, a human resource development programme has been initiated, including the introduction of annual performance reviews and individual development plans for faculty and staff. ESB Business School will be the pilot for the roll-out of human resource strategy on the faculties.

With internationalisation being at the heart of ESB’s special attention is paid to leverage international and intercultural competences and experience. Faculty exchange with national and international partners is widely supported. Academic coordinators and administrative staff, too, engage in staff exchange, participate in conferences or on fairs.
ESB faculty benefit from a variety of qualification and career development proposals such as:

- a broad range of didactic qualification and training seminars offered by the didactics and teaching centre which Reutlingen University established in cooperation with two neighbouring Universities of Applied Sciences;
- seminars and professional qualification offered by "Gesellschaft für Hochschuldidaktik", a state agency for the advancement of teaching in higher education;
- a broad range of seminars ranging from pedagogy, communication, intercultural competence to IT skills is also offered through the university;
- support of individual qualification measures (individual qualification budget is available to all staff);
- the "Teaching in English" qualification programme offered by the university;
- “ESB Kultur” – initiative initiated by a standing work group to further develop ESB campus culture and provide for an inspiring work environment;
- “ESB ethics” – initiative: transfers ESB’s shared values of respect, trust, responsibility and commitment into everyday academic practice and campus life;
- services offered by the network “dual career solutions” supporting dual career families in science and research relocating to the Reutlingen area;
- teaching reductions are granted for school management functions.

In order to increase the number of female professors at German institutions of higher education, the Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF) started a Programme for Women Professors in 2007. Reutlingen University actively supports and engages in the programme aiming at increasing the number of female researchers and professors to 15%. The university regularly offered workshops for female professors and staff to enhance management and leadership competences. The programme “springboard” for female academic staff attracted a big part of ESB staff, interested in raising their management skills.

Full-time tenure-professors are entitled to apply for a sabbatical of one semester after completing 4 years of service. According to the state higher education law a period of another 4 years must have passed, before the next leave may be granted. In providing faculty members with this opportunity the school benefits greatly because professors have the opportunity to pursue research projects or to update skills and knowledge.

Adjunct faculty are included in qualification measures: additional measures to increase participating faculty qualification have been approved by ESB board and will be implemented from 2015 onwards. In general ESB adjunct faculty are highly qualified and possess extensive industry experience with many of them being experts in their profession and field of teaching. Course offerings address mainly teaching methodology, but also enhance personal and social skills (e.g. intercultural competence). The course programmes attain a very positive response. Employees and faculty dispose of an annual budget of 500 EUR for professional qualification and development activities, of which professors and staff actively make use of to develop their individual careers.

The Business School has sufficient staff which is professionally qualified to assist students to successfully complete their degree programmes. Staff also actively support ESB’s educational mission. Even though ESB Business School complies to high quality standards, there is room for improvement which will be addressed in 2015 by assessing staff development strategies, qualification proposals and exchanges and by developing supporting guidelines.

IV.5 What is the role of diversity within the framework of the university’s strategy?

ESB Business School has adopted and actively supports the mission statement of Reutlingen University, which recognises the cultural diversity in our society as a chance and an essential prerequisite for competitiveness and innovation. The diversity of humans – cultural and religious affiliation, age, or physical abilities – is as a valuable resource for the University and
thus developing services for diverse requirements and needs is part of the diversity management of the University and the Business School. In 2013 a series of public lectures (Studium Generale) with the title “Freiheit, Gleichheit, Vielheit” covered different aspects of diversity.

Staff capacities are allocated to the function of equal opportunity and diversity management (Referentin für Gleichstellung und Diversity); contact persons are nominated among staff to answer specific questions (e.g. on disabilities, Family Services Centre etc.). The University took the initiative to participate in a diversity audit conducted by the German foundation promoting science “Stifterverband für die Deutsche Wissenschaft”, starting in September 2014. The audit examines and encourages the university to deal with the challenges of diverse student populations concerning:

- strategy and structure of diversity management;
- diversity in teaching and learning;
- service and counselling;
- internal and external communication and participation;
- human resource management;
- IT and Infrastructure.

IV.6 What proportion of the university's profile (strategy, infrastructure, services offered, and networks) is less than 3-5 years old?

A selection of the most relevant innovation processes and results since 2009 are listed in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Timeline</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strategy</td>
<td>Finalised merger of ESB Business School</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>New vision and mission of ESB Baliness School</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Refinement of vision and mission</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adoption of strategic development plan 2012-2016</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adoption of AACSB standards alignment plan</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>revision of ESB Business School by-laws including new committees</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR</td>
<td>New presidency of Reutlingen University</td>
<td>Oct 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7 newly appointed professors in Study year 2008/09 and 8 newly appointed professors from 2009-2014</td>
<td>2008/09-2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Revised process design for the appointment of Professorships and introduction of new staff (Newcomer Prof Day)</td>
<td>2010-11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programmes</td>
<td>Fully revised Bachelor Portfolio:</td>
<td>From 2011 on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- International Business fully in English</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- International Operations and Logistics Management fully in English</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Revision of Master Portfolio</td>
<td>WS 2010/11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- New trilingual double-degree programme M.A. European Management Studies</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- MSc. Master of Operation and Logistics Management</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 new corporate programmes at KFRU</td>
<td>2009-2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research</td>
<td>Incentive system for publications, updated to include further support (FASY-Forschungsanreizsystem)</td>
<td>From 2009, updated 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participation in PhD processes (8 candidates)</td>
<td>2010/11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EU-Grant for international Logistics Project RobLog including Universities and companies</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Initiative European Learning factories</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ESB Business School actively monitors changes of its environment and takes them into account in the different working fields. The differentiation between short-term, medium-term and long-term development processes is comprehensible and the panel formed the view that ESB not only monitors but shapes its environment by taking adequate measures where necessary.

The development initiatives concern the regional, national and international activities of ESB. The representatives of ESB’s business partners that took part in the interviews confirmed that the Business School is capable of handling change processes and appreciated especially the fast but well considered reactions on short-term modifications.

The Business School possesses a quality assurance system which is comprehensive and leads to tangible consequences. The different aspects and instruments of the used PDCA-Cycle like the internal audits and review processes, the traffic-light-system or the balanced scorecard ensure constant development of ESB Business School. The efficiency of the quality assurance system was confirmed in the process of the German national institutional accreditation (Systemakkreditierung) that ESB has successfully undergone in 2013. In the view of the panel, ESB Business School demonstrates a high degree of self-commitment to high quality standards by questioning its structures and performance by the way of voluntary rating/ranking and accreditation processes (e.g. the membership in AACSB). The panel is impressed by this commitment but would like to emphasise once again that all the activities need human resource capacities (see chapter I).

Regarding the measures for development of the staff, the incentive system, the induction process, the mentoring, or the annual performance reviews are good examples of the effective system that is implemented at ESB. The panel appreciates that the many development offers are accessible to adjunct faculty as well.

Diversity is an issue at the Business School too. The panel came to the conclusion that at present diversity is embraced at ESB but clear structures are lacking. Therefore, the Business School takes part in the described diversity audit which will lead to results in 2016.

Criteria University Dynamics
IV.1 What approach does the university pursue in order to actively or reactively deal with changes within its environment or to pro-actively shape its environment?
IV.2 Does the university initiate change processes on its own initiative?
IV.3 How does the university’s quality management system ensure the continuous and systematic development of the university?
IV.4 What measures does the university use to promote the continuous development of its employees and organisation within the framework of the university’s strategy?
IV.5 What is the role of diversity within the framework of the university’s strategy?
IV.6 What proportion of the university’s profile (strategy, infrastructure, services offered, and networks) is less than 3-5 years old? Describe the most significant changes.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quality requirements</th>
<th>Exceptional</th>
<th>Exceeds quality requirements</th>
<th>Meets quality requirements</th>
<th>Does not meet quality requirements</th>
<th>Not relevant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV. 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV. 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV. 3</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV. 4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV. 5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV. 6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
B. Evaluation of the SWOT-Analyses

The ESB Business School carried out SWOT-Analyses for the five areas Management, Networking, Teaching/Learning, Research and Dynamic Development. Furthermore, the School developed a strategy for the advancement of core competencies and a strategy to develop competitive advantages on basis of the SWOT-Analysis for each area. The analyses contain sensible data and are therefore not part of the accreditation report.

Altogether, the panel considers the SWOT-Analyses as very well thought-out. They show clearly the high degree of self-reflection of ESB and the willingness to develop the processes and daily work activities wherever possible. The panel appreciates very much the strategies for the advancement of core competencies and to develop competitive advantages. The quantity of strategic measures or development possibilities per area appears very comprehensible. The panel is confident that following these strategies will enable ESB Business School to achieve the self-chosen goals.

Hence, the panel agrees with the results of the SWOT-Analyses but likes to mention the following aspects:

In the SWOT-Analysis for “Management” the Business School estimates the “stakeholder satisfaction” as one of the School’s opportunities. Due to the documents and especially after the interviews with the School’s stakeholders during the on-site visit, the panel has no doubt, that the Business School already achieved a very high degree of stakeholder’s satisfaction. The interview partners explained in detail the advantages of cooperation with ESB Business School, such as flexibility, a clear profile, fast reactions/answers and altogether high quality. The satisfaction is also shown in the research activities with companies and the external funding. Hence, the panel assesses the stakeholder’s satisfaction as a clear strength and not only as an opportunity. If the Business School is willing to increase its cooperation with external parties even more, the issue “stakeholder satisfaction” could be seen as a strength and an opportunity at the same time.

Another opportunity is the implemented instruments of the School’s management. The panel was impressed by the high quality of the Strategic Management Plan and the used traffic-light-system to trace the development of the single processes.

According to the panel an important threat is the overexpansion of the staff’s capacities (especially of the faculty). The panel formed the view that the management system of the Business School depends on a few responsible persons who – until now – agreed upon the implementation of the system and its strategic orientation. This agreement might change if one of the responsible persons leaves the School (e.g. the dean). Hence, in the view of the panel turnover of staff could be a threat for the Business School as it could bring the continuation of the strategy in danger. The panel therefore recommends anchoring structural sustainability in the Business School’s Strategic Management Plan. In this context the panel appreciates the annual performance reviews and target agreements of the School’s staff. These guarantee that – even if there are changes in the School’s management – the employees remain working (for a specific time) according to their stipulated individual target plans. Besides that the individual working load of the members of faculty concerning administrative duties is extraordinary high and does hardly allow to continue a further expansion of this burden. It is obvious that an extremely large number of committees is part of the ESB Business School’s governance structure.

Furthermore, it is the view of the panel that the current management structure has reached the limits imposed upon it by the law governing higher education in the state of Baden-Württemberg (Landeshochschulgesetz Baden-Württemberg, BW LHG from 09.04.2014) by emphasizing the role played by the dean, upon which the latest version of this law places limits.
Even if the panel assesses the current organisation at the School as considered and working very well – but with a look at the BW LHG –, there might be problems coming up in the future. For the panel, this is another reason to recommend focusing on sustainability aspects of the implemented management structures.

In the SWOT-Analysis of “Networking” the Business School identified the limited track record of international staff mobility as a weakness. The monitoring of faculty and staff mobility is on the way to be improved and aligned with strategic aims of international cooperation. Limitations to staff mobility (incoming and outgoing) are mainly seen in family obligations as well as in formal reasons such as inhibiting funding systems as well as high teaching loads and binding involvement in bodies and committees (regarding the numerous activities and the resulting risks see above and chapter I).

To the panel both reasons are comprehensible. Nevertheless the panel points out that staff exchange should be facilitated in order to enhance ESB Business School's strategy to promote its internationalization. The necessary conditions for increasing the activities are definitely good due to the high amount of international partner universities.

The panel noticed that one issue, the lack of PhD programmes, appears in three of the five SWOT-analyses. In the analyses of “Research” and of “Teaching and Learning” it is mentioned as a weakness. In the analysis of “Networking” it is called a threat. Overall, the analyses show a special focus of ESB on the matter of PhD possibilities. In the view of the panel, the Business School attaches too much importance to this supposed weakness.

The application orientation is very strong at the Business School. ESB has very intensive and very successful cooperation with business and industry partners. The employability of the graduates is immense. Many students get a job even before they actually finish their studies (e.g. while writing their final theses in cooperation with business partners of ESB). The panel is convinced that graduates who have such good chances on the job market focus less on PhD possibilities. This was confirmed by students who participated on the interview during the site visit. The students saw the strengths and the advantages of ESB in the practice orientation in conjunction with application-oriented scientific work.

Accordingly, ESB is very successful in fulfilling its tasks as a university of applied sciences. The panel recommends not disesteeming the clear strengths of the application orientation by overestimating offering PhD programmes. ESB uses already its strong international network for cooperation with universities in the area of PhD. Therefore, the panel appreciates the analysis of “Research” where ESB comes to the conclusion that the implemented cooperation with universities with regard to PhD is a strength.

Furthermore, with regard to the field of research participants from ESB explained during the on-site visit that in case they had to decide whether ESB shall be experienced as a college or a university they would prefer a university. Even if the panel understands the strategic goal in general, it would like to point out that the achievement might be difficult to realise under the conditions of German universities of applied sciences. Making huge efforts to achieve the desired status is laudable, but the panel recommends that the school should while doing so taking great care maintaining the high quality of its core activities and responsibilities.

The panel agrees with the findings of the SWOT-Analysis for “Teaching and Learning”. In the view of the panel the most important result of the analysis is the found weakness regarding used innovative learning technologies (e.g. e-learning). The current used didactical concept fulfils all requirements but with regard to the fast-moving conditions in that area the weakness might already be a threat. Hence, the panel recommends pursuing the corresponding strategies very active.
C. Quality profile Institutional Accreditation of ESB Business School:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quality requirements</th>
<th>Exceptional</th>
<th>Exceeds quality requirements</th>
<th>Meets quality requirements</th>
<th>Does not meet quality requirements</th>
<th>Not relevant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter I Management</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter I.1</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter I.2</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter I.3</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter I.4</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter I.5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter I.6</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter I.7</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter II Networking</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II.1</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II.2</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II.3</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II.4</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter II.5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter III Teaching and Learning (Contents/Didactics), Research</strong></td>
<td><strong>III.1 Teaching and Learning</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.1</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.2</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.3</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.4</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.6</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.1.7</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter III Teaching and Learning (Contents/Didactics), Research</strong></td>
<td><strong>III.2 Research</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.2.1</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.2.2</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.2.3</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.2.4</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter III.2.5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter IV Dynamics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV.1</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV.2</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV.3</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV.4</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV.5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter IV.6</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>